

Megan Ryburn

Living the Chilean dream? Bolivian migrants' incorporation in the space of economic citizenship

**Article (Accepted version)
(Refereed)**

Original citation:

Ryburn, Megan (2016) *Living the Chilean dream? Bolivian migrants' incorporation in the space of economic citizenship*. *Geoforum*, 76 . pp. 48-58. ISSN 0016-7185
DOI: [10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.08.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.08.006)

© 2016 The Authors

This version available at: <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/67789/>

Available in LSE Research Online: September 2016

LSE has developed LSE Research Online so that users may access research output of the School. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LSE Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain. You may freely distribute the URL (<http://eprints.lse.ac.uk>) of the LSE Research Online website.

This document is the author's final accepted version of the journal article. There may be differences between this version and the published version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

Living the Chilean dream? Bolivian migrants' incorporation in the space of economic citizenship

Abstract

As with most contexts of South-South migration, the Bolivian-Chilean case remains severely under-researched. Responding to this paucity of research, this paper addresses Bolivian migrants' inclusions in and exclusions from economic citizenship in Chile. Conceptually, the paper calls for a holistic and spatially aware approach to comprehending migration and citizenship, proposing the overarching conceptual framework of interacting *transnational social spaces of citizenship* representing its legal, political, social, and economic dimensions. It then focuses particularly on the *transnational social space of economic citizenship*, using this conceptual approach as a means to bring into better dialogue research on the migrant division of labour, precarious employment, labour exploitation, financial exclusion, and migrant citizenship practices. The analytical potential of the conceptual framework is explored through examining the specific geographies of the Bolivian-Chilean space of economic citizenship to reveal the reality of what is increasingly being referred to as the 'Chilean dream'. Drawing on nine months of multi-sited ethnography and 76 semi-structured interviews, the paper addresses migrants' economic situation in Bolivia before examining their changes in circumstances following migration to Chile, looking particular at the migrant labour niches of wholesale clothing retail, agriculture, and domestic labour. It explores the structural factors leading to economic marginalisation in Bolivia and labour exploitation in Chile. Additionally, it analyses the practices in which migrants may engage to challenge their exclusion from economic citizenship, and the role that migrant organisations play in encouraging, and at times constraining, such practices.

Keywords: migration; citizenship; economic marginalisation; labour exploitation; Bolivia; Chile

1. Introduction

In a context in which migration from global South to North is in the headlines almost daily, it is easy to forget that there are also highly significant flows of people across borders within the global South. In the academic arena, South-South migration is severely under-researched, reflective perhaps of academia's Northern-centric bias, and the agendas of funding bodies and policy-makers within the global North (Hujo and Piper, 2010; Melde et al., 2014). With respect to Latin America, where flows from poor to middle-income countries are increasing, there is certainly a paucity of scholarly work (Martínez Pizarro, 2011). Chile is one such country where migration flows have augmented significantly – as people come in search of the so-called 'Chilean dream' (Cárdenas, 2015), migration to the country has almost quadrupled since 1990 (Departamento de Extranjería y Migración, 2010; Martínez Pizarro, 2011). Yet to date, with some notable exceptions (e.g. Acosta, 2015; Stefoni, 2013), research has not kept pace with this important social and economic change.

The case of Bolivian migrants in Chile has been particularly ignored, despite their numbering at least 50,000 of a migrant population conservatively estimated to be some 352,000 (Martínez Pizarro, 2011). Moreover, Bolivians have been thought to conform one of the most marginalised migrant groups in the country (Cano et al., 2009). This paper is one of the first to discuss the Bolivian case, presenting empirical findings but also reflecting conceptually on the research on citizenship and migration, predominantly carried out to date in contexts of South-North migration. In so doing, it proposes a conceptual framework of *transnational social spaces of citizenship* for comprehending citizenship and migration. It focuses specifically on the *transnational social space of economic citizenship*, exploring the Bolivian-Chilean migration context in order to further elucidate the concept. The paper is based on nine months of multi-sited ethnographic fieldwork, carried out across five sites in Chile (Santiago and Arica) and Bolivia (El Alto/La Paz, Santa Cruz, and Oruro) between August 2013 and May 2014. In addition to extensive participant observation with migrant organisations, at community events, and in migrants' homes and workplaces, 60 semi-structured interviews were undertaken with Bolivian migrants in Chile – 40 in Santiago and 20 in Arica – and 16 interviews were conducted with representatives of migrant organisations and the state across all sites.

Drawing on this rich data, the paper has three aims, expanded on accordingly in each of its remaining three sections. The first provides an introduction to the overarching conceptual framework of interacting transnational social spaces of citizenship – representing its legal, political, social, and economic dimensions – that has developed out of the research. This framework provides an innovative means of comprehending migration and citizenship more holistically, accounting for citizenship's multiple facets and the interactions between them from a spatially aware perspective. The second section introduces and defines in greater detail the transnational social space of economic citizenship. The third and final section explores the specific geographies of the Bolivian-Chilean transnational social space of economic citizenship. Thus the paper both contributes empirically to enhance understanding of a South-South migration flow, and also indicates potential pathways for a more comprehensive conceptualisation of geographies of migration and citizenship from an economic perspective.

2. Transnational social spaces of citizenship

Analysing migrants' lived realities through the lens of citizenship has proven a fruitful approach for comprehending the transnational inclusions and exclusions they face (Coutin, 2007; Isin and Nielsen, 2008; Menjívar, 2006; Ong, 1999; Reed-Danahay and

Brettell, 2008). In particular, scholars of citizenship and migration have advocated a focus on migrant citizenship in practice in order to comprehend how it is actually experienced in the everyday as opposed to how it is normatively represented (Ho, 2008; Staeheli et al., 2012; Ferbrache and Yarwood, 2015). Such analyses have sometimes struggled, however, to consider holistically the 'formal' (legal status) and 'substantive' (social and political) aspects of citizenship (Holston, 1998) in such a way that accounts for: the interactions between them; how they are produced within and across nation-state borders; and the multiple ways in which migrants may be simultaneously included in and excluded from citizenship.

A spatial approach to citizenship and migration has been adopted by some in order to attempt this (Coutin, 2003; Goldring and Landolt, 2013; Isin and Rygiel, 2007; Lee, 2010; Menjívar, 2006) because, as Staeheli et al. (2012, p.641) put it, citizenship 'is inseparable from the geographies of communities and the networks and relationships that link them'. Whilst making extremely important advances, I suggest that the complexity of inclusion and exclusion is not fully recognised by the frameworks proposed to date because spaces of citizenship have been conceptualised as binary (as spaces of citizenship/non-citizenship e.g. Isin and Rygiel, 2007; Coutin, 2003) or triadic (as spaces of citizenship/non-citizenship with a third space in between e.g. Lee, 2010; Menjívar, 2006). Moreover, the focus has often been on the politico-legal dimensions of citizenship (e.g. Goldring and Landolt, 2013) rather than its social and economic components, despite the latter being established as important for full participation in society (Lister, 2003; Riaño, 2011). This does not fully allow for the multitude of simultaneous in/exclusions from different aspects of citizenship that migrants may experience transnationally.

Responding to this, the concept of overlapping, interlocking transnational social spaces of citizenship is proposed to better represent the spheres in which migrants' relationships to legal, political, social, and economic aspects of citizenship can be understood as occurring. This draws on the concept of 'transnational social spaces', developed since the 1990s (e.g. Faist, 1998; Jackson, Crang and Dwyer, 2004; Smith, 2005; Collyer and King, 2015). Synthesising scholarship on the topic, Levitt and Jaworsky (2007, pp.131–132) define 'transnational social spaces' as 'arenas' that

are multi-layered and multi-sited, including not just the home and host countries but other sites around the world that connect migrants to their conationals and coreligionists. Both migrants and nonmigrants occupy them because the flow of people, money, and "social remittances" (ideas, norms, practices, and identities) within these spaces is so dense, thick, and widespread that nonmigrants' lives are also transformed, even though they do not move.

Historical context is also important to the production of transnational social spaces, as is place, which both constructs and is constructed by transnational practices (e.g. Ehrkamp, 2005).

Reflecting an understanding of citizenship as a process of 'self-making and being-made' (Ong, 1996, p.737), transnational social spaces of *citizenship* are produced through interactions between individual migrants and non-migrants, in addition to processes initiated by states and their actors, and sometimes interventions by international organisations such as the International Labour Organisation. Groups within civil society such as migrant organisations also play a role in their production. These interactions are influenced by history, and impacted by, and impact on, place. Thus the framework of transnational social spaces of citizenship takes a profoundly geographical approach to comprehending the production of citizenship across nation-state boundaries in terms of both structural processes and agentic practices. Furthermore, building on the intersectional perspectives already taken within the research on migration and citizenship (McIlwaine, 2015; Riaño, 2011), it is understood that individuals' relationships to these spaces are deeply influenced by their social identities, such as gender, nationality, ethnicity, and class.

The framework allows comprehension, then, of how at any one time a migrant may be positioned differently, and multiply, in each of a range of overlapping transnational social spaces of citizenship, reflecting citizenship's formal and substantive elements. She is neither entirely a citizen, nor a 'non-citizen', nor in a clearly delineated 'third space' of citizenship. Rather, there is an unpredictable quality to her experiences of citizenship across multiple dimensions. She lives uncertain citizenship. Perhaps she is on the very periphery of legal citizenship in one nation-state – holding a tourist visa, for example – whilst in full possession of legal citizenship in another where she does not currently reside. In terms of the political, she exercises her right to extra-territorial voting, and also is a grassroots activist in the country where she is living. With respect to social citizenship (see especially Lister, 2003), she had better access to healthcare in the country she has left than in the country where she lives at present. She has left one country because she could not find waged employment there, and is precariously incorporated in the space of economic citizenship in the other.

Almost all of these aspects of her citizenship could shift and change depending on both her exercise of agency through everyday citizenship practices (such as applying for legal residency, perhaps with support from a migrant organisation), and on structural factors (such as changes to immigration law, perhaps precipitated by recommendations

from an international body). A change in one may result in a change in another, although not necessarily. Her different positions within these spaces are highly contingent on power relations and her social identities – both in terms of how she is perceived and how she perceives herself – and also grounded in place and historical context. Thus, in the Chilean-Bolivian context, the possibilities of inclusion in the diverse spaces of citizenship are likely to be different for an ethnically Aymara Bolivian from rural La Paz who did not finish secondary school from those of a *mestiza* Bolivian from Cochabamba with a university degree.

The broad framework of transnational social spaces of citizenship offers the possibility of a spatially cognisant approach to understanding better how migrants' inclusions in and exclusions from citizenship are constructed. It accounts for both structure and agency, and the ways in which place-based, historically contingent social identities and power relations impact on migrants' possibilities of citizenship. By considering the legal, political, social, and economic aspects of citizenship as separate but overlapping transnational social spaces, it provides a conceptual approach through which to engage in fine-grained analysis of each aspect whilst considering how it interacts with the others. To further explain the framework, I turn now to examine in greater depth the transnational social space of economic citizenship.

2.1 Defining the transnational social space of economic citizenship

Here I use the overarching conceptual framework to bring into closer dialogue scholarship on the migrant division of labour, precarious employment, labour exploitation, financial exclusion, and practices of citizenship. As outlined, transnational social spaces of citizenship seem best understood as representing its legal, political, social, and economic elements. These four different yet interacting spaces reference T. H. Marshall's (1950) seminal thinking about the civil, political, and social spheres of citizenship; however, they also build on it in important ways. In particular, allowing for more robust consideration of the economic represents an important innovation. Whilst Marshall considered protection from poverty a social right, he did not expand further on the economic aspect of citizenship. Some feminist scholars (Kessler-Harris, 2003; Pateman, 1990, pp.179–209), however, have argued that economic incorporation through equal access to paid employment is fundamental to women's citizenship and thus the economic must be given greater weight in studies of citizenship. Riaño (2011) draws on this to recommend a more complete analysis of economic citizenship when researching migration, given the powerful impact that nationality and migratory status, as well as gender and other identities, can

have on equal access to paid employment. I build on this argument for greater consideration of the economic and explore how precisely we might understand this arena of citizenship, and how thinking in terms of the construction of transnational social space of citizenships can enable this.

Riaño (2011, p.1543) designates economic citizenship as 'equal opportunity of access to jobs which correspond to [one's] professional qualifications and have long-term prospects'. Given the focus on professional work implied by this definition, however, I suggest that it may be more inclusive to think in terms of 'equal opportunity of access' to '*decent work*'. Decent work is defined as follows by the International Labour Organisation:

It is productive and secure work;

it ensures respect of labour rights;

it provides an adequate income;

it offers social protection;

it includes social dialogue, union freedom, collective bargaining and participation (ILO, 2006).

'Equal opportunity of access' to decent work by no means exists for many migrants. Rather, their ability to obtain work is profoundly affected by intersectionality: their categorisation by the state, employers, the media, and the general public on the basis of, inter alia, their (perceived) national, racial, ethnic, and gender identities often ascribes them certain positions within labour market hierarchies. Work such as that on 'global care chains' (e.g. Hochschild, 2000; Parreñas, 2000; Yeates, 2012) and the 'migrant division of labour' (Wills et al., 2010; see also Datta et al., 2009; McDowell, 2008) has been crucial in cataloguing and conceptualising the ways in which migrants are gendered and racialised into certain labour niches.

In addition to considering the ways in which gendered, racialised labour market hierarchies are produced and act to prevent migrant women and men from accessing decent work, it is also vital to detail and theorise the conditions under which migrants labour when the work in which they are engaged could not be classified as 'decent'. The concept of precarious work provides a partial framework for enabling this. Precarious work has been identified by Rodgers and Rodgers (1989, p.5) as that which involves 'some combination' of 'instability, lack of protection, insecurity and social or economic vulnerability', and this definition has gained currency (e.g. Lewis et al., 2014; Anderson, 2007, 2010; Waite, 2009; Barbier, 2004; Duell, 2004). Furthermore, the etymological and

philosophical indebtedness of 'precarious work' to the concept of precarity (from the French *précarité*) is one of its advantages as it indicates the inextricable linking of the economic to other spheres of people's daily lives (see Anderson, 2010; and on precarity more broadly see Butler, 2009; Waite, 2009).

Nevertheless, in a similar vein to Lewis et al. (2014) and Strauss and McGrath (2012), I propose that in order to better operationalize the concept of precarious employment, it is helpful to also reflect upon ideas more specifically around labour exploitation. Skrivankova's (2010) 'continuum of labour exploitation' is particularly illuminating. It has been developed in order to move beyond the binary of forced labour/decent work in order to consider the many blurred, grey areas in between. It offers a typology of forms of labour exploitation ranging from the most severe where migrants are the subjects of forced labour and may have been trafficked through less severe cases involving 'some form of violation of standards ... [such as] discrimination, payment under minimum wage, breach of contract' (Skrivankova, 2010, p.18). It is useful as it provides a specific tool with which to identify (and potentially prosecute) cases of labour exploitation.

So far I have wholly focused on migrants' access to the labour market as much of the work on migrants' economic conditions to date is centred on employment. In addition to considering employment, however, the concept of transnational spaces of economic citizenship aims to incorporate further economic considerations. Datta (2009) has highlighted migrants' more generalised financial exclusion, stressing the dearth of research on the issue, even though migrants are more likely than the average population to be 'unbanked' or 'semi-banked' (possessing access to only the most basic of current accounts and lacking access to savings schemes or credit). As Datta explains, a purview that is transnational in its scope is vital for understanding migrants' financial exclusion:

Not only do many migrants support the family members whom they have left behind through remittances, but they also have financial histories, assets and/or liabilities in home countries which intersect with, and shape, financial practices in host countries (Datta, 2009, p.333).

Whilst it was not my aim during fieldwork to record in-depth financial histories and presents of participants, by thinking in terms of a transnational space of economic citizenship this article engages with the spirit of Datta's statement to address the economic marginalisation of participants in both Bolivia and Chile in more general terms than only access to decent work. It connects with debates on remittances, and the false dichotomy of forced/voluntary migration in relation to the 'economic migrant', and also considers the potentially positive financial outcomes of migration. This is in addition to

accounting for the gendered and racialised barriers to migrants' accessing decent work, as well as the varied precarious and exploitative conditions that non-decent work entails.

Finally, room is also left for considering migrants' exercise of agency in relation to their economic citizenship. As indicated above, a transnational social spaces approach to comprehending citizenship focuses on migrants' everyday experience and practice of citizenship, as well as the processes from above that structure and constrain the practices in which they may engage. Such a perspective draws both on migration scholars who have approximated citizenship in this way (e.g. Ferbrache and Yarwood, 2015; Ho, 2008; Reed-Danahay and Brettell, 2008; Staeheli et al., 2012), and on key anthropological works developed in Latin American contexts (e.g. Holston, 2008; Lazar, 2008). It thus allows for consideration of what citizens 'are' rather than what they 'should be' (Lazar, 2013, p.6) within particular contexts.

3. In/exclusions from the Bolivian-Chilean transnational social space of economic citizenship

I move now to explore one such context – the geographies of the Bolivian-Chilean transnational social space of economic citizenship, first providing some contextual background in which to situate Bolivian migration flows to Chile. It is estimated that around 706,000 Bolivians, or 6.8 per cent of the population, currently reside outside the country (Pereira Morató, 2011, p.9), although some estimates put the figure as high as 14 to 23 per cent of the population (Bolivia Cultural, 2013; on Bolivian migration flows see also Hinojosa Gordonava, 2008; Mondaca Plaza, 2007). Argentina has long been a favoured destination for Bolivian migrants (see, for example, Bastia, 2007, 2012; Grimson, 1999; Preston, 2002). Following the 2001 Argentinean crisis, however, and the devaluation of the Argentine peso, those Bolivians who were compelled to migrate began to look to other destinations as well, and the Bolivian population resident in Argentina declined (Bastia, 2007). Outside Latin America, Spain became popular, particularly as it was not necessary for Bolivians to possess a visa to move to Spain until 2007 (Pereira Morató, 2011). The United States was also an increasingly appealing option for those with the resources to leave Latin America.

There were many on lower incomes, however, who could not afford to leave the continent, but who nonetheless still felt it imperative to leave the country. Whilst there have been marked improvements in access to healthcare and education since the 1970s, as Bolivia entered the twenty-first century it remained one of the poorest countries in Latin

America. In 2007 the government estimated that 60 per cent of Bolivian homes could not meet its own minimum standards in terms of housing and adequate access to potable water, food, and sanitation (Klein, 2011, p.282). From the early 2000s, Brazil, and particularly São Paulo, increased in popularity as a destination for Bolivian migrants with limited economic resources and little formal education (Pereira Morató, 2011; Satie Bermudes, 2012; Tavares de Freitas, 2014).

Within Latin America, the other shift in Bolivian migration away from Argentina has been to Chile, although there is less information available on Bolivian migrants in Chile than on their counterparts in Brazil and Argentina. This is in spite of the significant numbers entering Chile, especially when one considers the markedly smaller population of Chile in comparison to Brazil.¹ In 2009 it was thought that the population of Bolivians in Chile was 24,116 (Martínez Pizarro, 2011, p.128), however the Bolivian consulate in Chile declared in 2011 that there were approximately 50,000 Bolivians residing permanently in Chile – of those, some 30,000 were thought to have irregular migratory status (Pereira Morató, 2011, p.39).

This is consonant with general shifts in migration towards Chile since the fall of the Pinochet dictatorship in 1990. In 1992, there were an estimated 114,597 foreigners living in Chile, or 0.9 per cent of the total population. This has almost quadrupled, with conservative estimates putting the migrant population at 352,344 in 2010, around two per cent of the population (Departamento de Extranjería y Migración, 2010). The increase in migration to Chile can largely be explained by the steady economic growth and comparative political and social stability that Chile has experienced since the fall of the dictatorship (Gideon, 2014). It is thought that 37 per cent of migrants are Peruvian, 17 per cent are Argentinean, and nearly seven per cent are Bolivian, followed by Colombians and Ecuadorians (Martínez Pizarro, 2011). The majority of research and activism to date has focused on Peruvian migrants (e.g. Acosta, 2015, 2013; Arriagada and Moreno, 2013; Cabieses and Tunstall, 2013; Gideon, 2014; Núñez Carrasco, 2013; Pavez Soto, 2010, 2012; Stefoni, 2002, 2004, 2009).

The following sub-sections offer one of the first in-depth qualitative analyses of the Bolivian case. Multi-sited ethnography was selected as the methodological approach best suited to this research for a number of reasons, not least because it enabled a broad, cross-border exploration of the experiences of a largely un-researched migrant group. It is a

¹ The current population of Chile is approximately 17.8 million in comparison with a population of over 200 million in Brazil (CEPAL, 2015).

methodology considered particularly appropriate for researching transnational migration (Amelina and Faist, 2012) given its potential for overcoming ‘methodological nationalism’ (Wimmer and Glick Schiller, 2002), and has been used effectively in a variety of contexts (e.g. Riccio, 2011; Mand, 2011; Vives, 2012). Furthermore, an ethnographic approach has been seen as particularly appropriate for researching citizenship practices (see, for example Lazar, 2008), which has been reflected in research carried out by those studying migrants’ citizenship practices (Reed-Danahay and Brettell, 2008; Però, 2011; Garapich, 2008). Engaging in multi-sited ethnography enabled me to follow the people (Marcus, 1995) and their practices within transnational spaces of citizenship, maintaining a sense of the multiple intersections across and flows within these spaces. Participant observation and semi-structured interviews were the ideal complement to one another in allowing me to work with migrant participants, migrant organisations, and experts on migration, taking into account intersectionality. This is reflected in the following analysis, which addresses first migrants’ economic circumstances in Bolivia before examining their changes in circumstances following migration to Chile, maintaining a transnational perspective on their citizenship.

3.1 Economic marginalisation in Bolivia and migration as a ‘practice of citizenship’

Economic marginalisation in Bolivia was the leading cause of migration for most of the participants in this research, both from rural and urban areas (18 and 78 per cent of participants, respectively). In Bolivia, poverty disproportionately affects rural dwellers in the altiplano, many of whom are indigenous. This is partially a consequence of a lack of agricultural infrastructure and uneven access to basic services, healthcare and education (Oviedor Treiber, 2012). Inability to maintain even subsistence farming in small communities on the high plateaus has been exacerbated by drought, which has increased in recent years due to climate change (Oviedo Treiber, 2012). This was commented upon by all rural participants, most of whom were indigenous and from such communities, and corroborated through my observations and conversations in Bolivia, particularly in the town of Patacamaya, *departamento* of La Paz, which is a hub for smaller rural communities.

Indicating the important of taking an intersectional perspective on citizenship that is also grounded in place, for those from the cities, the processes causing exclusion from economic citizenship were different. As has been reported in relation to South-North migration (e.g. Creese and Wiebe, 2012; Datta et al., 2007; McDowell, 2008; Redstone Akresh, 2006), those who migrate from Bolivia’s urban areas tend not to be the very

poorest in society and indeed, may be well-educated and from middle-class families, although many in this study had not had the opportunity to progress beyond secondary schooling. The majority of urban participants had been in some kind of employment in Bolivia – generally ‘unskilled’ or ‘semi-skilled’ – however it was commented upon by most people I interviewed who had been living and working in urban areas that the salaries were insufficient to ensure a reasonable standard of living. Constanza, 32, from Sucre, explained succinctly, saying, ‘in Bolivia the salaries are very low. They barely give you enough to eat, and not even to eat well’.

One of the key issues for many was that, whilst the salaries they earned might provide enough for subsistence, they did not provide enough to save, buy land or a house, support their children if they wanted to go on to higher education, or generally ‘look to the future’ in the words of Aimy, 34, from Cochabamba. This was exacerbated if there was any kind of difficulty within the family. This was the case for Amanda, 25, from El Alto, for example, when, following a dispute, she and her family were evicted from the property they rented from relatives at below market rate. In such situations of crisis, lack of savings or the safety net of comprehensive social security led some participants to take out loans with high interest rates, which they realistically had little chance of paying off with the salaries they were earning in Bolivia (cf. Datta, 2007 on debt precipitating migration to the UK).

Migrants who came to Chile from both urban and rural areas identified the various factors that prevented them from participating as full economic citizens in Bolivia as structural. Their narratives indicated that they viewed themselves as hard workers who, for reasons beyond their control, could not advance beyond living at subsistence level, and, at times, experienced extreme poverty with even basic food needs going unmet. Thus, although what could be identified as precarious employment was a central factor contributing to migrants being positioned on the economic periphery in Bolivia, it was not the whole story. Whilst not indigent, many experienced a fairly hand-to-mouth existence and lacked the possibility of planning financially for the future. The irony, of course, is the incompatibility between their full *legal* citizenship status in their home country and the realities of their access to the economic dimension of substantive citizenship.

To speak of migration as a ‘practice of citizenship’ may provide a means of highlighting this irony: by moving to a place where they do not possess full legal citizenship, many migrants act on the dream of becoming economic citizens, either in that country or through remittance sending and saving to enable this in the future in their country of origin. It is perhaps, therefore, a way of challenging the false binary between

forced and voluntary migration, and indicating the complex relationship between structure and agency. Migration for economic reasons has often been viewed as 'voluntary' migration, and to a degree there is an element of choice involved in this type of migration. Nonetheless, if, as above, many of the economic factors underlying participants' migration can be understood as structural, the notion of a dichotomy between 'forced' and 'voluntary' migration is complicated (on this point in a different context, see, for example, Black, 2003). By referring to it as a practice of citizenship, it both indicates the agency of the migrant, but also reminds us that they are taking this decision because they cannot be full, certain citizens in their country of origin.

3.2 Living the dream? Mixed economic outcomes of migration

For some, migration did result in their edging closer to the 'Chilean dream' of improved economic circumstances that they had envisaged. Sometimes, this was in a largely material sense as they were able to send remittances to Bolivia or save money in Chile. Indicating that, as Datta et al. (2007, p.5) contend, the effects of remittances are 'highly variable and context specific', migrants I spoke to used remittances in a number of ways – from supporting children and elderly parents to financing debt to buying property (on the remittances debate see also Ballard, 2005; Carling, 2004; de Haas, 2007; Kapur, 2003). Aside from such tangible improvement in their economic citizenship status transnationally, there were also less quantifiable ways in which migrants might experience greater involvement in the transnational space of economic citizenship.

Specifically, there was an interesting gendered phenomenon whereby male migrants in regular migratory situations who worked in physically demanding employment, such as in construction or as mechanics (but excluding employment in agriculture), commented on a variety of qualitative improvements as a consequence of their employment in Chile. More advanced technology combined with somewhat greater concern for the health and safety of the worker and, in general, respect for an eight to nine hour working day made for employment that was less physically demanding and dangerous than in Bolivia. Moreover, several participants commented on the opportunities that working in Chile had given them to informally learn about new technology and more advanced techniques. Finally, this particular group of male migrants felt they had slightly more disposable income in Chile than they earned in Bolivia for carrying out the same type of work. This led to better quality of life. For Jonathan, 21, from Sucre, it translated to being able to buy ham and milk, which for him in Bolivia had been

luxury items. Alberto, 30, also from Sucre, commented that now his wages were sufficient to 'even buy my wife a little present for her birthday'.

These men conveyed the sense that they felt that their employment in Chile enabled them to participate economically more fully than they had before. It must be highlighted, however, that the greater economic inclusion experienced by migrant men working in physically demanding employment only applied in cases where they were legally resident. For those migrant men in irregular migratory situations undertaking physical labour, work and pay conditions could be very precarious, indicating the overlap of the legal and economic spaces of citizenship. Additionally, of the 60 migrants I interviewed in depth, under a third managed to remit regularly or made regular savings in Chile. Many simply couldn't manage to send money to Bolivia and cover their living costs in Chile, and sometimes great sacrifices were made by those who did (as is increasingly recognised in the debate around remittances more broadly e.g. Datta et al., 2007; Levitt and Nyberg-Sørensen, 2004). Unfortunately, continuing or increased economic exclusion was a more common outcome of migration to Chile from Bolivia than its converse, as I will indicate through discussion of three particularly illustrative employment niches. Moving from the most to the least severe, I explore lived realities within wholesale clothing retail, agriculture, and domestic labour and cleaning.

3.2.1 Wholesale clothing retail

The garment industry is notorious for poor, sometimes appalling, labour conditions. In South America, Buenos Aires and São Paulo are known for the abuses of migrant workers (frequently Bolivian) who labour in textile factories dotted throughout the cities (Bastia, 2007; Satie Bermudes, 2012; Tavares de Freitas, 2014). In Santiago, it is not so much with regards to the production but rather the wholesale retail of garments where abuses of labour rights occur. During the course of this research, I uncovered a case of human trafficking for labour exploitation in wholesale garment retail in Santiago, and was also made aware of the labour exploitation occurring more broadly within this sector (cf. Montero Bressán and Ferradás Abalo, 2015 on sweatshops and trafficking in Buenos Aires). Cata and Marta, the women involved, became key informants in my research.

Cata was 25 and from El Alto. She spoke only Aymara as a child and had struggled in her adolescence to learn Spanish to fluency. Nevertheless, she progressed to university, attending the Universidad Pública de El Alto, where she studied Social Work. Public universities in Bolivia are free; however, students must pay for living costs and study materials. After completing three years of her degree, Cata was unable to continue with

her education as her parents could no longer afford to support her. Moreover, she was struggling to keep up with the workload because she did not have access to a computer.

Marta, 35, was from Oruro and married with three children, aged sixteen, thirteen, and ten. She had no schooling and was illiterate. Like Cata, her first language was Aymara. She spoke Spanish, but at times it was difficult to understand due to her use of non-standard grammar. In Bolivia, Marta worked in a factory iodising salt, and her husband worked in the garment industry. Their wages were so low that they were struggling to provide for their children so that they could remain in education, which was their primary objective. Marta and her husband decided that she should migrate to improve their financial situation.

Both Cata and Marta responded to commercials that they heard on local radio in Bolivia advertising for workers to come to Chile. They were 'interviewed' by Don X (who professed to be the business owner), offered the job, and told that they would make several hundred US dollars a month – far more than they could earn in Bolivia. On separate occasions, through an elaborate coercive process, they were accompanied by bus across the border by Don X as far as Arica. They were then sent alone to Santiago, where they arrived at night, thoroughly disoriented, at the place where they were to work and sleep.

Cata and Marta were then subject to sleep deprivation, crowded living conditions, and severe restriction of payment of wages, strategies typically used by human traffickers/exploiters (Hopper and Hidalgo, 2006). They were required to work from 6:30am to 12:00am six days a week selling clothes in bulk and sorting new deliveries as they arrived. They slept four to a small room in a space near the shop that was also used as a warehouse. They were not paid, but informed that they receive their wages in full at the end of a year's work. Additionally, again indicating the overlap between the economic and the legal, Cata and Marta were led to believe that the temporary resident visa,² which the exploiters paid for, bonded them to one employer for a year. They believed they would enter into irregular migratory situations if they left, and could face deportation as a consequence (another common strategy of traffickers/exploiters; see Skrivankova, 2010). Furthermore, whilst never subjected to physical abuse, they were kept isolated from

² Under the MERCOSUR agreement, all Bolivians are entitled to a one-year MERCOSUR Temporary Resident Visa allowing them to work in Chile. They are not bonded to a single employer.

Chilean society – and thus from the prospect of social and political inclusion – and a relationship of almost total dependence on the exploiters was created.

Analysing their case in relation to the transnational social space of economic citizenship enables understanding of the structural and agentic factors producing the level of exclusion experienced by Cata and Marta, in addition to the role of social identities and power relations. In structural terms, relatively lax enforcement of labour laws in Chile, the difficulty of prosecuting cases of trafficking for labour exploitation, and the lack of information in the public domain in Bolivia and Chile regarding trafficking and labour exploitation worked to the advantage of the trafficker/exploiter. The traffickers/exploiters – who were a Bolivian couple – were clearly fully aware of these factors. Furthermore, as a consequence of their own transnational connections, the exploiters appear to have been fully cognisant of the vulnerabilities of Cata and Marta due to the intersections of socio-economic status, class, gender, and race. There is also the question of Cata and Marta's exercise of agency in affecting their position within the transnational social space of economic citizenship. Deception, coercion, and manipulation were so great as to severely limit their freedom of choice, contributing to the classification of the situation they were in as one of trafficking and forced labour – at the sharp end of the spectrum of labour exploitation. Their exercise of agency was, however, crucial to the practices they engaged in so as to move from almost total exclusion from economic citizenship to incipient inclusion.

I first interviewed Cata and Marta in early October 2013 in the shop where they were working. After my initial interview, I involved the migrant organisation which I refer to as MO1, with whom I collaborated closely throughout fieldwork, after realising the gravity of the situation. Together we liaised with the human trafficking unit of the Policia de Investigaciones (PDI). The PDI carried out an investigation, and were convinced that it was a case of trafficking for labour exploitation. They were, however, unable to gather enough evidence to lead to prosecution. The positive outcome was that both Marta and Cata managed to leave the situation of forced labour of their own volition once they realised the magnitude of what had occurred, and that possessing an MTRV meant that they were in a regular migratory situation and were not bonded to one employer. Sadly, they did not recuperate the wages they had been owed due to the lack of prosecution. They both returned to Bolivia for the summer of 2013 to 2014, and then came again to Santiago in early 2014, determined to find decent work and experience greater economic citizenship. With assistance from MO1 in the case of Marta, they were able to find employment in which their labour rights were respected. Whilst the intercession of a

migrant organisation was crucial in this case, Cata and Marta's own agentic actions were also fundamental in challenging their exclusion from the transnational space of economic citizenship.

3.2.2 Agriculture

As with the garment industry, agriculture is well-known for precarious work and labour exploitation, particularly of migrant workers (e.g. Arcury and Quandt, 2007; Das et al., 2001; Holmes, 2013) Until very recently, the conditions of migrant workers in agriculture in Chile have been entirely neglected in research on migration. A recent study, however, presents a quantitative analysis of a survey carried out with 220 migrants, 60 of whom were Bolivian, with half working in agriculture (Rojas Pedemonte and Bueno Moya, 2014). Summarising the results, Rojas Pedemonte and Bueno Moya (2014, p.86 my translation) state that:

[T]he subsample of Bolivians is that which presents the highest levels of lack of information with regards to legal matters ... Moreover, it is the subsample with the highest proportion of low wages (below US\$275), and which has the highest levels of both lack of contract, and concentration in unskilled employment.

Reflecting these conclusions, of the seven migrants (four male and three female) I interviewed who worked in agriculture, six did not have contracts. Only one earned the Chilean minimum monthly wage of US\$340. In addition to the basic markers measured in the quantitative study, my research indicated other factors that demonstrated exploitation of agricultural workers in the north of Chile. All lived in very poor conditions on the *parcelas* [agricultural smallholdings] where they laboured; in shacks made of plywood and corrugated iron with camping stoves to cook on, and rudimentary bathrooms shared by around 20 people. On average, they worked nine to ten hours a day, six and a half days a week – far exceeding the maximum 45 hours a week stipulated by Chilean labour laws. As with Cata and Marta, poor living conditions and long working hours contributed to workers' isolation and dependency on their employer, and indicate the role of the temporal in precarious employment (Anderson, 2010), to which I would also add the importance of physical place. In relation to the latter, the work in itself could be categorised as falling within the three Ds definition – dirty, dangerous, and difficult.³ I witnessed participants squatting for hours at a time thinning pepper plants in a greenhouse where temperatures were easily over 30 degrees Celsius. There was no

³ The so-called '3D' definition is a neologism that comes from the Japanese three 'Ks' – kitani, kitsui, and kiken – meaning the same (Quayson and Arhin, 2013, p.163; Connell, 1993).

provision of water. Women worked with their babies and toddlers alongside them or on their backs.

In addition to lack of contracts, low pay, long working hours, and difficult and potentially dangerous working conditions, workplace discrimination and a degree of coercion were further elements that contributed to the exploitation that characterised these participants' working lives. The attitude of the predominantly mestizo *patrones*⁴ and overseers towards their largely Aymara workers was sometimes racist, and they capitalised on the fact that all participants were working on Tourist Visas.⁵ Luisa, 25, from rural Oruro, had this to say:

Because you're a foreigner they want to treat you, they want to make you work more, without stopping. They say you're not advancing, that you have to hurry ... And because you're a foreigner ... they threaten that they can kick you out [of the country].

Although not as extreme as in the case of Cata and Marta, there was certainly a degree of coercion involved in the relationship between employer and employee.

In sum, many of the conditions experienced by participants labouring in agriculture in the North of Chile would suggest that, whilst not in conditions of forced labour, they were certainly on the very margins of the transnational social space of economic citizenship. With regards to the structural factors leading to these conditions, many are similar to those mentioned above. Lax enforcement of labour laws was certainly an important contributing factor. Migrants' position within the labour market hierarchy was entrenched through landowners' often racist attitudes towards their workers on the basis of nationality and ethnicity. Nonetheless, migrants also exercised a degree of agency in choosing to remain on the *parcelas*. Whilst options for leaving were restricted, there was some potential for finding other work. Amongst other factors, however, the flexibility of being able to return to Bolivia at will because of the seasonal nature of agricultural employment was important for some.

Some workers also engaged in practices reminiscent of James Scott's (1987) 'weapons of the weak' in order to improve their position within the space of economic citizenship. For example, Beimar, 28, from Oruro, working in the agricultural market in Arica negotiated for equal pay with his Chilean counterparts by partially withdrawing his

⁴ Landowner, boss. The term *patrón* was that used by participants – it has decisively colonial overtones.

⁵ This is common due to the high cost of the MERCOSUR Temporary Resident Visa (US\$283 for Bolivians). Migrants working in agriculture are also often actively encouraged by employers to work on Tourist Visas.

labour for a period. He began to work a lot slower than he normally would, or simply failed to turn up to work. He knew that his employer valued him highly because he worked harder and faster than many of the other men. This type of 'foot dragging' (Scott, 1987) eventually saw him receive a pay rise.

As in the case of Marta and Cata, the support of migrant organisations was also very important in fomenting practices that would better migrants' economic situation. In Arica, Rojas Pedemonte and Bueno Moya (2014) found that those who had contact with a migrant organisation were the most likely to have greater knowledge of their labour rights. I found that a group on a *parcela* with whom MO1 had been in contact regarding labour rights were organising to improve their working conditions. Crucially, they were requesting that their *patrón* give them employment contracts. This would ensure financial security as they would be guaranteed a monthly wage, rather than being paid at the end of each day's shift, and it would place them in a stronger legal position should they encounter any problems with their employer. Furthermore, greater inclusion in spaces of economic and legal citizenship sometimes led to improved social and political incorporation – this group, for example, was also organising to demand better living conditions and were interested in contacting other migrant agricultural workers.

3.2.3 Domestic labour and cleaning

If agricultural labour is the least discussed of migrant employment niches in Chile, then domestic labour and cleaning is certainly the most (e.g. Arriagada y Moreno, 2013; Stefoni, 2009; Stefoni and Fernández, 2013). This is a reflection of the feminisation of migration to Chile (Acosta, 2015; Cano et al., 2009), the high numbers of migrants working in these sectors, but also the tendency within migration research to focus almost exclusively on Santiago (Lube-Guizardi and Garcés, 2013), where work in domestic labour is concentrated. Of those I interviewed, ten women in Santiago were working in domestic labour or cleaning. A further two women who were not working at the time of interview had previously worked as *nanas* or in cleaning. No male interviewees, or interviewees of either gender in Arica, worked in domestic labour or cleaning. Thus the Santiago-centric focus of employment in these areas was mirrored in my study, as was its feminisation.

All except one of the women who worked or had worked in domestic labour and cleaning, especially the former, experienced violations of their labour rights, although not to such a severe degree as those working in agriculture. They were receiving the minimum wage or above, and in the case of those who were *nanas puertas adentro* [live-in maids/nannies] they received food and board additional to this. Nevertheless, many both

puertas adentro and *puertas afuera* [live out] did not have employment contracts, which could cause multiple problems. Those *puertas adentro* also generally worked more than the 72 hours per week stipulated by Chilean law, were given insufficient breaks, and were usually not permitted to take sick leave. Fernanda, 45, from Santa Cruz, working as a *nana* *puertas adentro* described a typical day:

I work from eight in the morning until ten, eleven at night. If the baby doesn't sleep, well, I don't either. And then I have to get up – ready for action – again the next day ... We work more than the hours we should and they don't pay our taxes, they don't pay overtime.

Psychologically or emotionally challenging working relationships were another difficulty confronted by almost all participants in domestic labour and cleaning (cf. Arriagada and Moreno, 2013). For Javiera, 43, from Santa Cruz one of the worst things about her job was the requirement to wear a uniform. As Javiera told it, 'when ... they put me in a uniform, I cried. I felt humiliated. I know that work is dignified, that it does not denigrate, but I felt humiliated.' For her, the uniform implied that she was in a servile role and presented a profound challenge to her identity. Her intense feeling of humiliation was partially because of the de-skilling implied by working as a *nana* – in Bolivia, she worked as a nurse (cf. Riaño, 2011).

Whilst not positioned as marginally as those in agriculture or wholesale clothing retail, participants in domestic work and cleaning were still partially excluded from the transnational social space of economic citizenship. There are a variety of structural factors that contribute to the generation of the exploitative and discriminatory conditions they experienced, not least Chile's domestic labour law. It reflects the uncomfortable compromise between servility and labour rights noted by Stefoni and Fernández (2013) in relation to contemporary domestic work. It has changed somewhat now (Ley Fácil, 2015), but at the time of the research, whilst some labour rights such as having a contract were enshrined in law for domestic workers, they could be required to work up to 72 hours a week for the minimum monthly wage. For all other workers in Chile, 45 hours per week was the maximum number of hours that could be worked before overtime must be paid in addition to the minimum monthly wage. Domestic workers could also be required by their employers to wear a uniform inside the house and in public spaces. The very legislation governing this particular labour niche was therefore discriminatory and contributed to exclusion from economic citizenship. As well as such structural factors, however, agency must again be considered. All of the participants in domestic labour had exercised freedom of choice in engaging in that work. Overall, many of the women in domestic service or cleaning saw the financial benefits as sufficient to act as a trade-off for certain labour

rights. They also at times engaged in practices to negotiate improvement in their working conditions.

Ong (2010 [1987]) has analysed the ways in which such practices of resistance can be highly gendered. Others (Ngai, 2005; Ustubici, 2009) have also examined the ways in which women may use stereotypes of female irrationality and emotion to their advantage, and subvert the notion of the woman as dominated by biological functions. In this research, bringing into focus the gendering of the phenomenon, Javiera drew on the limited resources available to her in order to negotiate with her employer so as not to wear a uniform. Acting on her genuine feelings of emotion, but also, one might speculate, utilising gendered stereotypes of 'emotional women', she said that she 'cried to the *señora*⁶ and I said to her that I didn't want to wear the uniform anymore. I felt humiliated, frustrated as a professional, I said to her ... and I didn't wear [the uniform] anymore'. Similar practices had been undertaken by other women working as *nanas*.

Migrant organisations also play a role in affecting the practices in which women in domestic work may engage. In this instance, one migrant organisation, who I refer to as MO2, actually acted to effectively curtail migrant women's ability to enter further into the space of economic citizenship. Amongst other services, MO2 provides an employment programme for migrant women, where the vast majority of jobs they have available are for domestic work. Potential employers are invited to register with the service and are then given the opportunity to interview various women who may be interested in working for them.

Seven female participants based in Santiago had had contact with MO2. Five of them had found employment as domestic workers through the organisation. Unfortunately, the experiences of all of them had been negative, and included abusive language being used towards them by employers, being denied employment contracts, and being dismissed without notice, in addition to working more than 72 hours per week. Furthermore, they commented that there was a racialised, nationality-based hierarchy operating whereby Colombian, then Peruvian, then women of other nationalities, and finally Bolivian women were selected by employers using MO2's employment programme (cf. Anderson, 2007). There were clear problems with the system used by MO2, some of which were recognised by a staff member from the organisation whom I interviewed. First, there was no formal follow-up process once the women found employment. Second,

⁶ The term commonly used by women working as *nanas* to refer to their employers. Note the gender implications regarding who is in charge of domestic arrangements in the home (see Arriagada and Moreno, 2013).

the process by which potential employers was filtered was deeply problematic. It was only after three negative reports from three different women who had been employed by the same person that they would be removed from the books for a six-month period while, as the staff member put it, they 'went away and thought about things and changed their attitude'. If they then re-employed someone through MO2 after the six-month break and the same problem was reported, they would be suspended from the service for a year.

Thus, whilst in some cases migrant organisations acted to support migrants to move from exclusion from spaces of economic citizenship to inclusion, there were unfortunately cases in which they were complicit in migrants' continued exclusion, demonstrating, amongst other things, the ambiguous nature of civil society organisations (on this point, see, for example McIlwaine, 2007; Mercer, Page and Evans, 2008). Whilst they certainly had good intentions, it would seem that MO2 may contribute to the poor conditions experienced by many migrant women in domestic labour. Furthermore, their promotion of such work as appropriate for migrant women unwittingly contributes to the production of a gendered, racialised migrant division of labour. Additionally, for these women exclusion from the spaces of social and political citizenship is made more likely due to the isolation entailed by the long hours and type of work undertaken by a *nana*.

4. Conclusion

Building on previous theorisations of migration and citizenship (e.g. Goldring and Landolt, 2013; Ong, 1996; Staeheli, 2012), this paper has introduced the framework of transnational social spaces of citizenship as a means by which to conceptualise how migrants live everyday citizenship. This conceptualisation allows for complexity and messiness in a way that previous binary and triadic theorisations of spaces of citizenship had not. Thinking about citizenship as overlapping and intertwined transnational social spaces – representing its legal, economic, social, and political aspects – enables cognisance of the ways in which migrants are often simultaneously incorporated in and marginalised from various of its dimensions across nation-state boundaries. It also encourages thinking about both the structural factors and agentic practices that construct these spaces and migrants' positions within them, accounting for the ways in which social identities affect possibilities of inclusion. Additionally, it allows for the important role of migrant organisations within these spaces, considering the ways in which they both encourage and inhibit migrants' practices of citizenship.

The incorporation of economic citizenship within the overarching conceptual framework builds on feminist scholarship (Kessler-Harris, 2003; Riaño, 2011), which has indicated the necessity of considering more fully citizenship's economic dimension, particularly when researching migration. As has been illustrated through analysis of the case of Bolivian migrants in Chile, thinking in terms of a transnational social space of economic citizenship brings together work that examines a variety of different aspects of migrants' relationship to 'the economic'. It allows consideration not only of migrant access to decent work, the gendered and racialised migrant division of labour, and precarious employment, but also takes into account the wider meaning of 'the economic' for migrants, including the economic conditions contributing to migration, the forced/voluntary dichotomy as it pertains to the 'economic migrant', and the potential for positive economic outcomes of migration. Finally, the agentic practices in which migrants engage in order to incrementally improve their access to economic citizenship are given due weight, as are the ways in which such practices are encouraged – or constrained – by migrant organisations. It is to be hoped that such an approach may facilitate more comprehensive understanding of the myriad barriers to economic and other dimensions of citizenship faced by migrants, particularly in under-researched contexts of South-South migration. Additionally, it may encourage closer examination of practices that can potentially be used to overcome such barriers.

Works Cited

- Acosta, E., 2013. Valorar los cuidados al estudiar las migraciones: La crisis del trabajo de cuidado y la feminización de la inmigración en Chile. In: C. Stefoni, ed., *Mujeres inmigrantes en Chile: ¿Mano de obra o trabajadoras con derechos?* Santiago, Chile: Ediciones Universidad Alberto Hurtado.
- Acosta, E., 2015. *Ciudadanos en crisis: Mujeres migrantes hacia España y Chile*. Santiago, Chile: Ediciones Universidad Alberto Hurtado.
- Amelina, A., and Faist, T., 2012. De-naturalizing the national in research methodologies: Key concepts of transnational studies in migration. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 35(10), pp.1707–1724.
- Anderson, B., 2007. *Battles in time: The relation between global and labour mobilities*. [Working Paper] Oxford: Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, University of Oxford. Available at: https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/fileadmin/files/Publications/working_papers/WP_2007/WP0755%20Bridget%20Anderson.pdf [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].
- Anderson, B., 2010. Migration, immigration controls and the fashioning of precarious workers. *Work, Employment & Society*, 24(2), pp.300–317.

- Arcury, T.A., and Quandt, S.A., 2007. Delivery of health services to migrant and seasonal farmworkers. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 28(1), pp.345–363.
- Ballard, R., 2005. Remittances and economic development in India and Pakistan. In: S.M. Maimbo and D. Ratha, eds., *Remittances: Development impact and future prospects*. Washington: World Bank Publications, pp.103–118.
- Barbier, J.-C., 2004. *A comparative analysis of 'employment precariousness' in Europe*. European Cross-National Research and Policy. [online] ESRC, pp.7–18. Available at: <<http://www.xnat.org.uk/PDFs/SeventhSeries/Seminar%203%20Learning%20from%20Employment%20and%20Welfare%20Policies%20in%20Europe.pdf#page=7>> [Accessed 5 Jan. 2015].
- Bastia, T., 2007. From mining to garment workshops: Bolivian migrants in Buenos Aires. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 33(4), pp.655–669.
- Bastia, T., 2012. 'I am going, with or without you': Autonomy in Bolivian transnational migrations. *Gender, Place & Culture*, pp.1–18.
- Black, R., 2003. Breaking the convention: Researching the 'illegal' migration of refugees to Europe. *Antipode*, 35(1), pp.34–54.
- Bolivia Cultural, 2013. *Las parcelas de la explotación: La migración de Bolivia en Sao Paulo*. [online] Bolivia Cultural. Available at: <http://www.boliviacultural.com.br/ver_noticias.php?id=364> [Accessed 20 Jul. 2015].
- Butler, J., 2009. Performativity, precarity and sexual politics. *AIBR. Revista de Antropología Iberoamericana*, 4(3), pp.i–xiii.
- Cabieses, B., and Tunstall, H., 2013. Socioeconomic vulnerability and access to healthcare among migrants in Chile. In: F. Thomas and J. Gideon, eds., *Migration, Health and Inequality*. London: Zed Books, pp.79–93
- Cano, V., Soffia, M., and Martínez Pizarro, J., 2009. *Conocer para legislar y hacer política: los desafíos de Chile ante un nuevo escenario migratorio*. Santiago, Chile: CEPAL.
- Cano, V., Soffia, M., and Martínez Pizarro, J., 2009. *Conocer para legislar y hacer política: los desafíos de Chile ante un nuevo escenario migratorio*. Santiago, Chile: CEPAL.
- Cárdenas, S., 2015. *Dejando todo atrás – el sueño chileno*. [online] Available at <<http://www.elcolombiano.com/colombianos-en-chile>> [Accessed 10 Jan. 2016].
- Carling, J., 2004. *Policy options for increasing the benefits of remittances*. [online] Oxford: Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, University of Oxford. Available at: <https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/fileadmin/files/Publications/working_papers/WP_2004/WP0408.pdf> [Accessed 5 Jan. 2015].
- CEPAL (Comisión Económica para América Latina), 2015. *CEPALSTAT: Base de datos y publicaciones estadísticas*. [online] CEPALSTAT: Base de datos y publicaciones estadísticas. Available at: <http://interwp.cepal.org/cepalstat/WEB_cepalstat/Perfil_nacional_social.asp?pais=CHL&idioma=e> [Accessed 22 Jul. 2015].
- Collyer, M., and King, R., 2015. Producing transnational space: International migration and the extra-territorial reach of state power. *Progress in Human Geography*, 39(2), pp.185–204.

- Connell, J., 1993. *Kitanai, kitsui and kiken: The rise of labour migration to Japan*. Economic and Regional Restructuring Research Unit. Sydney: University of Sydney.
- Coutin, S., 2003. Illegality, borderlands, and the space of non-existence. In: R.W. Perry and B. Maurer, eds., *Globalization under construction: Governmentality, law, and identity*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, pp.171–203.
- Coutin, S., 2007. *Nations of emigrants: Shifting boundaries of citizenship in El Salvador and the United States*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Creese, G., and Wiebe, B., 2012. 'Survival employment': Gender and deskilling among African immigrants in Canada. *International Migration*, 50(5), pp.56–76.
- Das, R., Steege, A., Baron, S., Beckman, J., and Harrison, R., 2001. Pesticide-related illness among migrant farm workers in the United States. *International Journal of Occupational and Environmental Health*, 7(4), pp.303–312.
- Datta, K., 2007. *Money matters: Exploring financial exclusion among low-paid migrant workers in London*. London: Queen Mary University of London.
- Datta, K., 2009. Risky migrants? Low-paid migrant workers coping with financial exclusion in London. *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 16(4), pp.331–344.
- Datta, K., 2012. *Migrants and their money: Surviving financial exclusion*. University of Bristol: Policy Press.
- Datta, K., McIlwaine, C., Herbert, J., Evans, Y., May, J., and Wills, J., 2009. Men on the move: Narratives of migration and work among low-paid migrant men in London. *Social & Cultural Geography*, 10(8), pp.853–873.
- de Haas, H., 2007. *Remittances, migration and social development: A conceptual review of the literature*. Social Policy and Development Programme Paper. [online] United Nations Research Institute for Social Development. Available at: <[http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/%28httpAuxPages%29/8B7D005E37FFC77EC12573A600439846/\\$file/deHaaspaper.pdf](http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/%28httpAuxPages%29/8B7D005E37FFC77EC12573A600439846/$file/deHaaspaper.pdf)> [Accessed 28 Mar. 2015].
- Departamento de Extranjería y Migración, 2010. *Informe anual Departamento de Extranjería y Migración, Ministerio del Interior*. [Informe Anual] Santiago, Chile: Ministerio del Interior. Available at: <<http://www.extranjeria.gob.cl/filesapp/Informe%20Estimacion%20Poblacion%20Extranjeros%202008.pdf>> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2015].
- Duell, N., 2004. *Defining and assessing precarious employment in Europe: A review of main studies and surveys*. ESOPE Project. [Discussion Paper] Munich: European Commission. Available at: <<http://www.economix.org/pdf/ECONOMIXanalysis-precarious-employment-Europe.pdf>> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2015].
- Ehrkamp, P., 2005. Placing identities: Transnational practices and local attachments of Turkish immigrants in Germany. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 31(2), pp.345–364.
- Faist, T., 1998. Transnational social spaces out of international migration: Evolution, significance, and future prospects. *European Journal of Sociology*, 39(2), pp.213–247.
- Ferbrache, F., and Yarwood, R., 2015. Britons abroad or European citizens? The negotiation of (trans)national space and citizenship by British migrants in France. *Geoforum* 62, pp.73–83.

- Garapich, M., 2008. Odyssean refugees, migrants, and power: Construction of the 'Other' and civic participation within the Polish community in the United Kingdom. In: D. Reed-Danahay and C. Brettell, eds., *Citizenship, Political Engagement, and Belonging: Immigrants in Europe and the United States*. New Brunswick, NJ.: Rutgers University Press, pp.124–143.
- Gideon, J., 2014. *Gender, Globalization, and Health in a Latin American Context*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Goldring, L., and Landolt, P., eds. 2013. *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada*. 3rd ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Grimson, A., 1999. *Relatos de la diferencia y la igualdad: Los bolivianos en Buenos Aires*. Buenos Aires: Eudeba.
- Hinojosa Gordonava, A., 2008. La visibilización de las migraciones transnacionales en Bolivia. *Tinkazos*, 11(25), pp.89–106.
- Ho, E.L.-E., 2008. Citizenship, migration and transnationalism: A review and critical interventions. *Geography Compass*, 2(5), pp.1286–1300.
- Hochschild, A., 2000. Global care chains and emotional surplus value. In: T. Giddens and W. Hutton, eds., *On the edge: Globalization and the new millennium*. London: SAGE Publications, pp.130–146.
- Holmes, S., 2013. *Fresh fruit, broken bodies: Migrant farmworkers in the United States*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Holston, J., 1998. Spaces of insurgent citizenship. In: L. Sandercock, ed., *Making the invisible visible: A multicultural planning history*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, pp.37–56.
- Holston, J., 2008. *Insurgent citizenship: disjunctions of democracy and modernity in Brazil*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Holston, J., 2008. *Insurgent citizenship: Disjunctions of democracy and modernity in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Hopper, E., and Hidalgo, J., 2006. Invisible chains: Psychological coercion of human trafficking victims. *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review*, 1, pp.185–209.
- Hujo, K., and Piper, N., 2010. *South-South Migration: Implications for social policy and development*. London: UNRISD (United Nations Research Institute for Social Development).
- ILO (International Labour Organisation), 2006. *Decent work: Objectives and strategies*. [online] Geneva: International Labour Organisation. Available at: <<http://www.nscb.gov.ph/nsm/23rdnsm/decentghai.pdf>> [Accessed 7 Nov. 2015].
- Isin, E., and Nielsen, G., 2008. *Acts of citizenship*. London: Zed Books.
- Isin, E., and Rygiel, K., 2007. Abject spaces, frontiers, zones, camps. In: E. Dauphinee and C. Masters, eds., *The logics of biopower and the war on terror: Living, dying, surviving*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp.181–203.
- Jackson, P., Crang, P., and Dwyer, C., 2004. *Transnational spaces*. London: Routledge.
- Kapur, D., 2003. *Remittances: The new development mantra?* G-24 Discussion Paper Series. [online] United Nations. Available at: <[25](http://www.cities-</p>
</div>
<div data-bbox=)

localgovernments.org/committees/fccd/Upload/library/gdsmdpbg2420045_en_en.pdf> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].

- Kessler-Harris, A., 2003. In pursuit of economic citizenship. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society*, 10(2), pp.157–175.
- Klein, 2011. *A concise history of Bolivia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lazar, S., 2008. *El Alto, rebel city: Self and citizenship in Andean Bolivia*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Lazar, S., 2013. *The anthropology of citizenship: A reader*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Lee, C., 2010. Bare life, interstices, and the third space of citizenship. *WSQ: Women's Studies Quarterly*, 38(1), pp.57–81.
- Levitt, P., and Jaworsky, B.N., 2007. Transnational migration studies: Past developments and future trends. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 33(1), pp.129–156.
- Levitt, P., and Nyberg-Sørensen, N., 2004. *Global migration perspectives: The transnational turn in migration studies*. Global Migration Perspectives. [online] Global Commission on International Migration. Available at: <http://www.iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/policy_and_research/gcim/gmp/gmp6.pdf> [Accessed 28 Mar. 2015].
- Lewis, H., Dwyer, P., Hodgkinson, S., and Waite, L., 2014. Hyper-precarious lives: Migrants, work and forced labour in the global North. *Progress in Human Geography* [online] Available at <<http://phg.sagepub.com/content/early/2014/09/16/0309132514548303.full>> [Accessed 6 Jan. 2015].
- Ley Fácil, 2015. *Trabajadoras y trabajadores de casa particular (Nueva Ley)*. [online] Biblioteca Nacional de Chile. Available at: <<http://www.bcn.cl/leyfacil/recurso/trabajadoras-y-trabajadores-de-casa-particular-%28nueva-ley%29>> [Accessed 1 Apr. 2015].
- Lister, R., 2003. *Citizenship: Feminist perspectives*, 2nd ed. New York, NY: New York University Press.
- Lube-Guizardi, M., and Garcés, A., 2013. Circuitos migrantes. Itinerarios y formación de redes migratorias entre Perú, Bolivia, Chile y Argentina en el norte grande chileno. *Papeles de Población*, 19(78), pp.65–110.
- Mand, K., 2011. Researching lives in motion. In: S. Coleman and P. von Hellermann, eds., *Multi-sited ethnography: Problems and possibilities in the translocation of research methods*. New York: Routledge, pp.41–53.
- Marcus, G.E., 1995. Ethnography in/of the world system: The emergence of multi-sited ethnography. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 24, pp.95–117.
- Marshall, T.H., 1950. *Citizenship and social class, and other essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Martínez Pizarro, J., 2011. *Migración internacional en América Latina y el Caribe: Nuevas tendencias y nuevos enfoques*. Santiago, Chile: CEPAL.

- McDowell, L., 2008. Thinking through work: Complex inequalities, constructions of difference and trans-national migrants. *Progress in Human Geography*, 32(4), pp.491–507.
- McIlwaine, C., 2007. From local to global to transnational civil society: Re-framing development perspectives on the non-state sector. *Geography Compass*, 1(6), pp.1252–1281.
- McIlwaine, C., 2015. Legal Latins: Creating webs and practices of immigration status among Latin American migrants in London. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(3), pp.493–511.
- Melde, S., Anich, R., Crush, J., and Oucho, J.O., 2014. Introduction: The South–South migration and development nexus. In: R. Anich, J. Crush, S. Melde and J.O. Oucho, eds., *A new perspective on human mobility in the South*. Global Migration Issues 3. New York, NY: Springer, pp.1–20.
- Menjívar, C., 2006. Liminal legality: Salvadoran and Guatemalan immigrants' lives in the United States. *American Journal of Sociology*, 111(4), pp.999–1037.
- Mercer, C., Page, B., and Evans, M., 2008. *Development and the African diaspora: Place and the politics of home*. London: Zed Books.
- Mondaca Plaza, J., 2007. Migración laboral y los flujos migratorios. In: J. Evangelista, ed., *Mirada sobre la migración boliviana: Aportes para el informe sobre las migraciones*. [online] La Paz, Bolivia: Capítulo Boliviano de Derechos Humanos, Democracia y Desarrollo. Available at: <<http://www.derechoshumanosbolivia.org/archivos/biblioteca/migracion.pdf>> [Accessed 20 Jul. 2015].
- Montero Bressán, J.M, and Ferradás Abalo, E.F., 2015. Sweatshop Workers in Buenos Aires: The Political Economy of Human Trafficking in a Peripheral Country. In: Waite, L, Craig, G., Lewis, H., and Skrivankova, K. (eds.), *Vulnerability, Exploitation and Migrants: Insecure Work in a Globalised Economy*. London: Springer.
- Ngai, P., 2005. *Made in China: Women factory workers in a global workplace*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Núñez Carrasco, L., 2013. Necesidades de las mujeres migrantes y la oferta de atención en salud reproductiva. Discrepancias y distancias de una relación no resuelta. In: C. Stefoni, ed., *Mujeres inmigrantes en Chile: ¿Mano de obra o trabajadoras con derechos?* Santiago, Chile: Universidad Alberto Hurtado.
- Ong, A., 1996. Cultural citizenship as subject-making. *Current Anthropology*, 37(5), pp.737–762.
- Ong, A., 1999. *Flexible citizenship: The cultural logics of transnationality*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Ong, A., 2010. *Spirits of resistance and capitalist discipline*, 2nd ed. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Oviedo Treiber, V., 2012. *Rural poverty, vulnerability and food insecurity: The case of Bolivia*. Potsdam: Universitätsverlag Potsdam.
- Parreñas, R.S., 2000. Migrant Filipina domestic workers and the international division of reproductive labor. *Gender & Society*, 14(4), pp.560–580.
- Pateman, C., 1990. *The disorder of women: Democracy, feminism, and political theory*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

- Pavez Soto, I., 2010. Los derechos de las niñas y niños peruanos en Chile: La infancia como un nuevo actor migratorio. *Revista Enfoques: Ciencia Política y Administración Pública*, 8(12), pp.27–51.
- Pavez Soto, I., 2012. Inmigración y racismo: Experiencias de la niñez peruana en Santiago de Chile. *Si Somos Americanos*, 12(1), pp.75–99.
- Pereira Morató, R., 2011. *Perfil migratorio de Bolivia*. Buenos Aires: Organización Internacional de Migraciones.
- Però, D., 2011. Policy change from below: Recognising migrants' political agency among Latin Americans in London. In: C. McIlwaine, ed., *Cross-border migration among Latin Americans: European perspectives and beyond*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp.119–138.
- Però, D., 2014. Class politics and migrants: Collective action among new migrant workers in Britain. *Sociology* 48(6), pp. 1156-1172.
- Però, D., and Solomos, J., 2010. Introduction: Migrant politics and mobilization: Exclusion, engagements, incorporation. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 33(1), pp.1–18.
- Prasad, P., and Prasad, A., 2000. Stretching the iron cage: The constitution and implications of routine workplace resistance. *Organization Science*, 11(4), pp.387–403.
- Preston, D., 2002. Identity and migration: Tarijeños and the Argentina experience. In: *Globalization and mobility of capital and labour in Latin America: Papers presented at the Third Congress of European Latinamericanists (CEISAL)*. The Third Congress of European Latinamericanists (CEISAL). Amsterdam.
- Quayson, A., and Arhin, A., 2013. *Labour migration, human trafficking and multinational corporations: The commodification of illicit flows*. London: Routledge.
- Redstone Akresh, I., 2006. Occupational mobility among legal immigrants to the United States. *International Migration Review*, 40(4), pp.854–884.
- Reed-Danahay, D., and Brettell, C., eds., 2008. *Citizenship, political engagement, and belonging: Immigrants in Europe and the United States*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Riaño, Y., 2011. Drawing new boundaries of participation: Experiences and strategies of economic citizenship among skilled migrant women in Switzerland. *Environment and Planning A*, 43(7), pp.1530 – 1546.
- Riccio, B., 2011. Exploring Senegalese translocal spaces: Reflections on multi-sited research. In: S. Coleman and P. von Hellermann, eds., *Multi-sited ethnography: Problems and possibilities in the translocation of research methods*. New York: Routledge, pp.73–88.
- Rodgers, G., and Rodgers, J., 1989. *Precarious jobs in labour market regulation: The growth of atypical employment in Western Europe*. Brussels: International Institute for Labour Studies, Free University of Brussels.
- Rojas Pedemonte, N., and Bueno Moya, S., 2014. Redes de inclusión: estudio estadístico de las condiciones sociolaborales de migrantes en Arica. In: J.T. Vicuña Undurraga SJ and N. Rojas Pedemonte, eds., *Migración y trabajo: Estudio y propuestas para la inclusión sociolaboral de migrantes en Arica*. [online] Santiago, Chile: Ciudadano Global and Organización Internacional para las Migraciones, pp.56–100. Available at:

<<http://creas.uahurtado.cl/2014/11/libro-migracion-y-trabajo-es-editado.html>>
[Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].

- Satie Bermudes, L., 2012. Two little Bolivias: The reality of Bolivian immigrants in the cities of Buenos Aires and São Paulo. Unpublished Masters thesis. University of Columbia. Available at: <<http://academiccommons.columbia.edu/catalog/ac:145491>> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].
- Scott, J., 1987. *Weapons of the weak: Everyday forms of peasant resistance*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Skrivankova, K., 2010. *Between decent work and forced labour: Examining the continuum of exploitation*. JF programme paper: Forced Labour. [online] York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Available at: <http://www.prostitutionresearch.info/pdfs_all/trafficking%20all/forced-labour-exploitation-full.pdf> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].
- Smith, M.P., 2005. Transnational urbanism revisited. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 31(2), pp.235–244.
- Staeheli, L.A., Ehrkamp, P., Leitner, H., and Nagel, C.R., 2012. Dreaming the ordinary: Daily life and the complex geographies of citizenship. *Progress in Human Geography*, 36(5), pp.628–644.
- Stefoni, C. ed., 2013. *Mujeres inmigrantes en Chile: ¿Mano de obra o trabajadoras con derechos?* Santiago, Chile: Ediciones Universidad Alberto Hurtado.
- Stefoni, C., 2002. Mujeres inmigrantes peruanas en Chile. *Papeles de Población. Centro de Investigación y Estudios Avanzados de la Población UAEM*, 8(33), pp.118-145.
- Stefoni, C., 2004. Inmigración y ciudadanía: La formación de comunidades peruanas en Santiago y la emergencia de nuevos ciudadanos. *Política*, 43, pp.319–336.
- Stefoni, C., 2009. Migración, género y servicio doméstico. Mujeres peruanas en Chile. In: M. Valenzuela and C. Mora, eds., *Trabajo doméstico: un largo camino hacia el trabajo decente*. Santiago, Chile: OIT.
- Stefoni, C., 2009. Migración, género y servicio doméstico. Mujeres peruanas en Chile. In: M. Valenzuela and C. Mora, eds., *Trabajo doméstico: un largo camino hacia el trabajo decente*. Santiago, Chile: OIT.
- Stefoni, C., and Fernández, R., 2013. Mujeres migrantes en el trabajo doméstico. Entre el servilismo y los derechos. In: C. Stefoni, ed., *Mujeres inmigrantes en Chile: ¿Mano de obra o trabajadoras con derechos?* Santiago, Chile: Ediciones Universidad Alberto Hurtado.
- Strauss, K., and McGrath, S., in press, 2016. Temporary migration, precarious employment and unfree labour relations: Exploring the ‘continuum of exploitation’ in Canada’s Temporary Foreign Worker Program. *Geoforum*, doi:10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.01.008.
- Tavares de Freitas, P., 2014. Família e inserção laboral de jovens migrantes na indústria de confecção. *Revista Interdisciplinaria de Mobilidad Humana*, 42, pp.231–246.
- Thayer, E., 2013. Trabajo y género: La condición social de inmigrante como referente para la definición de la identidad. In: C. Stefoni, ed., *Mujeres inmigrantes en Chile: ¿Mano de obra o trabajadoras con derechos?* Santiago, Chile: Ediciones Universidad Alberto Hurtado.

- Tsianos, V., and Papadopoulos, D., 2006. Precarity: A savage journey to the heart of embodied capitalism. *Transversal Texts, European Institute for Progressive Cultural Policies*. [online] Available at: <<http://eipcp.net/transversal/1106/tsianospapadopoulos/en>> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].
- Ustubici, A., 2009. Export-processing zones and gendering the resistance: 'Women's strike' in Antalya free zone in Turkey. *New Working Paper Series 24*. London: London School of Economics, Gender Institute.
- Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (PL106-386, 28 Oct., 2000). [online] US Department of State – Diplomacy in Action. Available at: <<http://www.state.gov/j/tip/laws/61124.htm>> [Accessed 12 Aug. 2016].
- Vives, L., 2012. Fragmented migrant (her)stories: Multi-sited ethnography and feminist migration research. In: G.T. Bonifacio, ed., *Feminism and Migration, International Perspectives on Migration*. New York, NY: Springer, pp.61–77.
- Waite, L., 2009. A place and space for a critical geography of precarity? *Geography Compass*, 3(1), pp.412–433.
- Wills, J., May, J., Datta, K., Evans, Y., Herbert, J., and McIlwaine, C., 2009. London's migrant division of labour. *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 16(3), pp.257–271.
- Wimmer, A., and Glick Schiller, N., 2002. Methodological nationalism and beyond: Nation–state building, migration and the social sciences. *Global Networks*, 2(4), pp.301–334.
- Yeates, N., 2012. Global care chains: A state-of-the-art review and future directions in care transnationalization research. *Global Networks*, 12(2), pp.135–154.