

[Christopher R. Hughes](#)

Militarism and the China model: the case of National Defense Education

**Article (Accepted version)
(Refereed)**

Original citation:

Hughes, Christopher R. (2017) *Militarism and the China model: the case of National Defense Education*. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 26 (103). pp. 54-67. ISSN 1067-0564

DOI: [10.1080/10670564.2016.1206280](https://doi.org/10.1080/10670564.2016.1206280)

© 2016 [Informa UK Limited](#)

This version available at: <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/67686/>

Available in LSE Research Online: September 2016

LSE has developed LSE Research Online so that users may access research output of the School. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LSE Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain. You may freely distribute the URL (<http://eprints.lse.ac.uk>) of the LSE Research Online website.

This document is the author's final accepted version of the journal article. There may be differences between this version and the published version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

Militarism and the China Model: The Case of National Defense Education

Christopher R. Hughes

Abstract

This paper proposes that advocates of the China Model deploy notions of culture and tradition in ways that hide the central role of militarism in Chinese politics. The hypothesis is explored by looking at the ways in which the country's military and paramilitary institutions are used to propagate militaristic values and practices through the policies of National Defense Education (NDE) and National Defense Mobilization (NDM). This yields evidence from policy documents, the discussions of educationalists and the content of teaching materials. The conclusion is that focusing on the role of militarism provides better insights into the way that social stability and political continuity is maintained than resorting to vague notions of 'culture' and 'tradition' in the China Model.

Key Words: Chinese militarism, Chinese nationalism, National Defense Education, China Model.

Christopher R. Hughes is Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

The Concept of Militarism

Militarism is a controversial concept due to its origins in nineteenth-century Europe, when it was used by liberals to discredit a certain type of politics that emerged in Prussia and reached an extreme point in the fascism of the 1930s.¹ It is equally controversial when it is rendered into Chinese as '*junguo zhuyi*' (军国主义), a term that is associated with the military leaders who ruled large parts of China as independent fiefdoms after the failure of the 1911 Revolution. Yet there is another equivalent Chinese term for 'militarism' that does not carry such negative

¹ Stargardt, Nicholas (1994), *The German Idea of Militarism: Radical and Socialist Critics 1866-1914*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 13.

connotations. This the term ‘shangwu jingshen’ (尚武精神), which literally means ‘the spirit of appreciating the military’ and refers to a tradition going back to the Western Han Dynasty (206 BCE – 25 CE), when the Confucian *Book of Odes* was interpreted to mean that the Duke of Zhou was delighted by military affairs.² It existed in a positive and dynamic relationship with pursuit of the values of the literati civil service (*wen* 文) right down to the Qing Dynasty (1644-1912) when it was particularly important as an idea for the ruling Manchu military caste.³ In the present-day, the term frequently appears in materials related to NDE and is widely advocated in popular writing.⁴

This more neutral concept is similar in some respects to the way in which social scientists have begun to understand militarism in the broader sense of ‘the penetration of social relations in general by military relations’.⁵ This widens the scope of analysis to explore how military values and institutions are used for political purposes beyond the tasks of the army as a fighting force, recognizing that ‘Most militarized people are civilians’ rather than members of the armed forces.⁶ As Alfred

² It is normally traced back to a commentary by Zheng Jian (郑笺), a scholar of the Western Han Dynasty on the poem ‘Drums and Bells’ (鼓钟), Book 6 Ode 4, of the *Book of Odes* (assumed to have been compiled by Confucius), which he interprets as meaning that the Duke of Zhou appreciates military ways.

³ Pamela Kyle Crossley, *Orphan Warriors: Three Manchu Generations and the End of the Qing World*, (Princeton University Press 1990); Peter C. Perdue, *China Marches West: The Qing Conquest of Central Asia*, (Cambridge Mass.: Belknap/Harvard University Press, 2005); Joanna Waley-Cohen, *The Culture of War in China: Empire and the Military under the Qing Dynasty*, (London and New York: IB Tauris, 2006).

⁴ See Christopher R. Hughes, ‘Reclassifying Chinese Nationalism: the *geopolitik* turn’, *Journal of Contemporary China*, (2011), 20(71), p. 608.

⁵ Martin Shaw, ‘Twenty-First Century Militarism: A Historical-Sociological Framework’, in Stavrianarkis and Selby, eds., *Militarism and International Relations: Political Economy, Security, Theory*, (Abingdon and New York: Routledge, 2013), p. 20.

⁶ Cynthia Enloe, *Globalization and Militarism: Feminists Make the Link*, (Lanham, Boulder: Rowman and Littlefield, 2007), Kindle Loc. 151.

Vagts, the first historian of militarism, explains, this makes the antithesis of militarism not pacifism, but civilianism.⁷

Militarism thus understood can be found to varying degrees in all modern societies, including China. The task for social scientific research is thus to explore how social relations are shaped through processes of militarization and de-militarization which are shaped by certain values. Herbert Spencer began to explore such values in the late nineteenth century, when he proposed that social dynamics are constrained to some degree by the existence of a 'militant' type of society. Within this, a high degree of regimentation is achieved by propagating values such as identifying goodness with bravery and strength, making revenge a sacred duty and cultivating a kind of patriotism that regards the triumph of one's own society as the supreme end of action. It is thus essentially authoritarian, creating a situation in which 'The habit of seeing everything officially controlled fosters the belief that official control is everywhere needed'.⁸ Such a model does not disappear under modernization but continues to exist in varying degrees in a dynamic tension with an 'industrial' type that encourages the creativity and individualism required for industry to flourish.

To understand how this broader understanding of militarism might inform the China Model discourse, it is useful to use concepts that have been developed from work on other societies that arrived late to industrialization. Studies of Germany between 1870 and 1945, in particular, show how militarism can be used by the political elite to build coalitions with interest groups that are opposed to popular demands for political reforms.⁹ Especially useful is the idea that it can be used as an important theme in the construction of a 'composite ideology' that has to be broad enough to appeal to powerful interest groups with wide ranging demands.¹⁰

⁷ Alfred Vagts, *A History of Militarism: Civilian and Military* (revised edition), (New York: Free Press [1937] 1959), p. 13.

⁸ Hebert Spencer, *The Principles of Sociology* (Vol. 2), (London and Oxford: Williams and Norton, 1902), p. 602.

⁹ Hans-Ulrich Wehler, *The German Empire 1871-1918*, (Oxford and New York: Berg [1973] 1997).

¹⁰ Woodruff D. Smith, *The Ideological Origins of Nazi Imperialism*, (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986).

Such literature is also useful for understanding the implications of militarism for late-industrializing societies that are of sufficient size to pose a threat to the international balance of power. The International Relations theorist, Jack Snyder, for example, explains how political elites attempt to strengthen their legitimacy by deploying 'strategic myths' to build a composite ideology. Political actors in Germany and Japan thus felt no contradiction in portraying the United States and Britain as both existential threats and 'paper tigers'. Such strategic myths can have a powerful impact on international relations if they force decision-makers to make irrational foreign-policy decisions, as with Germany's aggression against Russia/the Soviet Union, Britain and the United States and Japan's attack on Pearl Harbour.¹¹

Militarism and the China Model

There are good reasons to propose that such concepts can provide insights into the China Model. First, the basic dimensions of the Model have much in common with the understanding of militarism as a set of values and practices that are designed to prevent liberal political change. It is clearly authoritarian and opposed to the principles of liberal-democracy: in the economic sphere the state controls land and large-scale financial and industrial enterprises, while using market mechanisms to allocate labor, goods and capital; government is conducted by officials appointed on merit and led by an 'advanced and altruistic' elite, which is only checked and balanced by competition among bureaucracies; political legitimacy is derived from a popular belief in hierarchical values based on the family structure and opposed to individualism. Because these hierarchical values integrate the loose social fabric of districts and work units into the government system there is no need and no space for the emergence of a separate civil society sphere.¹²

Second, as Kennedy points out in his critique of the Beijing Consensus, it is quite

¹¹ Jack Snyder, *Myths of Empire: Domestic Politics and International Ambition*, (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991).

¹² Pan Wei, '当代中华体制：中国模式的经济，政治，社会解析' ('The Present-Day Chinese System: Explaining the China Model's Economics, Politics and Society'), in Pan (ed.), *中国模式：解读人民共和国的60年* (*The China Model: Understanding 60 Years of the PRC*), Beijing: Zhongyang bianyi chubanshe, 2009, pp. 3-85. See also Zhao Suisheng's discussion of Pan's book in this issue of the *Journal of Contemporary China*.

normal for rapid economic growth to be accompanied by authoritarianism in East Asian societies, including Japan before World War Two and Taiwan and the Republic of Korea in the post-War period.¹³ Although Kennedy does not talk specifically about militarism, such societies were formed through the construction of hierarchical and disciplinarian structures under long periods of martial law.

Third, events such as the opening ceremony of the 2008 Beijing Summer Olympic Games and the military parade held in Beijing on September 3, 2015, to commemorate the 70th anniversary of the defeat of Japan, make it clear that China's political elite is prepared to invest significant resources in propagating values and themes associated with militarism. That much was made in the Chinese media of the fact that China's arsenal of ballistic missiles contains weapons that can both destroy enemy aircraft carriers and hit targets across the United States indicates that this has important implications for foreign and security policy.

Such evidence is circumstantial however. To further substantiate the hypothesis that militarism needs to be included in any account of China's current politics, it is necessary to find evidence of a policy of propagating values and relationships that are clearly derived from military models. Such evidence should also show that this policy can be understood as part of a composite ideology that has political purposes beyond the fighting of wars. Moreover, it should show that this ideology includes 'strategic myths' that form a link between domestic politics and foreign policy. The policy of National Defense Education (NDE) is a good source for such evidence.

The Content of National Defense Education (NDE)

The National Defense Education Law (NDEL) (国防教育法) was passed in April 2001 and requires all citizens to undergo NDE from primary school onwards. It was drafted to codify an already existing set of policies in response to the call to 'rule by law' (依

¹³ Scott Kennedy, 'The Myth of the Beijing Consensus', *Journal of Contemporary China*, 19(65), (2010), p. 475.

法治国) that was approved by the Fifteenth National Congress of the CCP in 1997.

The process involved several years of conferences and debates among various layers of government, academic experts, and the military and continued with work on the curriculum guidelines after the law was passed.¹⁴ The contents and function of NDE were complemented and expanded with the passing of a National Defense Mobilization Law (NDML) (国防动员法) in February 2010.¹⁵

The curriculum for NDE can be found in directives drawn up under the auspices of the Ministry of Education, and the General Staff Department and Political Affairs Department of the People's Liberation Army (PLA) in 2001 and 2002.¹⁶ These clarify four objectives: the strengthening of consciousness of national defense; establishing the 'spirit' of national defense; acquiring knowledge; and learning skills.

The NDE established a National Defense Mobilization Committee (NDMC) (国防动员委员会) to draw up a fuller set of guidelines, issued as the *Outline of National*

¹⁴ 区政飏 (Ou Zhengbiao), '国家国防动员委员会综合办公室负责人就《中华人民共和国国防动员法》答记者问' (Member of the General Office for National Defense Mobilization Answers Questions from Reporters about the 'PRC Law on National Defense Mobilization'), 2012. Online at 110 Falu Zixun Wang: <http://www.110.com/ziliao/article-269146.html> (consulted November 11, 2015).

¹⁵ '中华人民共和国国防动员法' ('National Defense Mobilization Law of the PRC'), State Council, 26 February 2010. Online: http://www.gov.cn/flfg/2010-02/26/content_1544415.htm (accessed 21 December 2015).

¹⁶ State Council (2001), Document 48 '关于在普通高等学校和高级中学开展学生训练工作意见' (Views on Normal High Schools and Elite Middle School Initiation and Development of Student Military Training Work), Ministry of Education, General Staff Department Political Affairs Department (2001). Online at Zhengzhou University, Department of People's Armed Forces <http://www5.zzu.edu.cn/wzb/jsxl/8ac2809c3c13e297013c13fa00db0105.html> (accessed November 11, 2015).

Defense Education for all Citizens, in December 2006.¹⁷ Chapter 7 establishes the following contents for NDE:

- Theory: Evolution of Chinese military theory from Marxism-Leninism through to Hu Jintao; defense policy and military strategy; defense construction; defense struggle – especially the theory of information warfare.
- Defense Knowledge: The national territory, adjacent seas and airspace; information warfare; high technology; defense economics; the armed forces; military leadership system; strength of national military power; the volunteer system and defense mobilization system.
- Defense History: The country's ancient, modern and contemporary military history, promoting patriotism, collectivism, and education in revolutionary heroism. Emphasis should be on the bloody struggles of the Chinese nation to achieve unification, independence and wealth and power; the role of the CCP in leading the whole people and the army in the revolution; stimulating patriotism by understanding the noble character and glorious deeds of revolutionary martyrs, national heroes and righteous individuals.
- Defense Situation and Responsibilities: Understanding the international and domestic situations to oppose splittism and to protect national unity; clarifying the challenging security environment; clarifying the responsibility for national defense construction and struggle, strengthening a crisis mentality among the citizens (增强公民的忧患意识).

¹⁷国防动员委员会 (National Defense Mobilisation Committee), ‘全国防教育大纲’ (‘Outline of National Defense Education for all Citizens’), 2006. Online at China.com.cn: , http://www.china.com.cn/aboutchina/data/guofang/2008-07/05/content_15959893.htm (accessed November 11, 2015).

- National Defense Technology Capability: Military training for students and national defense exercises for the masses; defensive measures for air raids and nuclear war, battlefield rescue, use of light arms, and military techniques for the individual soldier and units; building morale and stamina.

Local authorities adapt these measures to their particular requirements. An idea of what this means in practice can be gained from the Shanghai Municipal Regulations for NDE, set out in October 2007. These call on schools to build knowledge of the nation's historical and present situation of national defense and to teach knowledge of military affairs. Specialist courses are supposed to teach technical subjects, such as defense theory, law, technology and economics. It is also integrated into the general curriculum and extra-curricular studies in kindergarten primary and junior middle schools by promoting the national flag, symbol and anthem, along with military flags, symbols and songs. It continues beyond formal education, with citizens being taught about national defense through a combination of ideological education, the law and the role of the military in establishing 'socialist spiritual civilization'.¹⁸

More information about the content of the curriculum can be gained from textbooks that have been approved for use in schools by the NDMC. These start with a manual for teaching military skills at primary and junior secondary school (starting age 6), which covers military drill, the use of light arms, basic combat skills, map reading and orienteering, and outdoor training. It contains illustrations showing the correct way to stand, march, kneel and salute. A chapter on the use of light firearms explains the different categories of weapons and ammunition, including a section on the construction and mechanics of the Model 81 Automatic Infantry Rifle (the PLA version of the Kalashnikov AK47).¹⁹

¹⁸ Shanghai City, '上海市国防教育条例' ('Shanghai Municipal Regulations for National Defense Education'), 2007. Online: <http://zbb.sh.gov.cn/byfg/Pages/byfg001.aspx> (accessed November 11, 2015).

¹⁹ 国防教育编委会 (ed.) ('Editorial Committee for National Defense Education'), *小学, 初中军事技能训练读本 (Reader for Drill in Military Skills for Primary and Junior School)*, Beijing: Educational Science Publishing House and Shenyang: Baishan chubanshe, 2008, pp. 21-28.

A chapter on battlefield skills explains how to destroy tanks and infantry and defend a base. It also covers the importance of maintaining the right kind of attitude in battle and how to use terrain to one's advantage, accompanied by illustrations of infantry in combat. Instructions are given on how to kill the enemy, as in this extract from the section on urban warfare:

If you discover an enemy, use close range fire to destroy him. If the door is closed, force it open and fire into the room or throw grenades taking advantage of the shock to enter and eliminate the enemy. If the enemy tries to escape, use hand-to-hand combat or close range fire to eliminate it.²⁰

Chapters on outdoor activities explain how pastimes such as camping are to be encouraged because they strengthen determination and harden the body and because they can be combined with military training.

Further insights into the political implications of NDE can be gained from a 2008 series of textbooks for the first three years of junior secondary school (for children aged 12-14).²¹ The topics covered by the chapters in each year are as follows:

1: The contribution of the CCP's paramount leaders to military thought, from Mao in Year 1 to Hu Jintao in year 3. This is followed by introductions to non-Chinese military thinkers.

2: How the military system works, starting in year one with an explanation of the Anti-Secession Law (passed in 2005 to codify the use of armed force against Taiwan). Subsequent years explain the system of military leadership, the structure of the armed forces and the role of military academies.

3: National borders.

4: Patriotic literature, including stories from the classics to illustrate the statecraft and stratagemes used in ancient China.

²⁰ Ibid. p. 52.

²¹ 国防教育编委会 (Editorial Committee for National Defense Education), *国防教育知识普及读本 (初中一年级, 二年级, 三年级)* (*General Reader in National Defense Education Knowledge, (Junior Middle School Years 1, 2, 3)*), Beijing: Jiaoyu kexue chubanshe, 2008.

5: A military song.

6: Introduction of one Chinese and one foreign military figure.

7: Combat skills.

8: Defense technology.

9: Stories of famous battles to illustrate the changeable conditions of combat.

10: A story from military history.

In order to understand how this curriculum is disseminated throughout society it is necessary to look at the institutional architecture that has been established for implementing NDE.

The Institutions of NDE

The NDE and NDML put in place a pyramid of institutions for policy development and implementation. At the top of this sits the NDMC, which reports to the State Council and the Central Military Commission (CMC). At its base are county-level defense mobilization commissions. The content of the curriculum is undertaken by a State Defense Education Commission, which works with the CMC. Local governments are supposed to take the initiative in adapting the guidelines produced by these higher organizations for use in their respective regions. All 'relevant departments' are expected to cooperate in ensuring that NDE duties are carried out smoothly. Enterprises, the media and cultural institutions such as museums, monuments and memorials are also expected to engage in NDE.

Within the formal education system, all schools are required to include NDE across the curriculum, including in examinations. Extra-curricular activities are carried out jointly with organizations such as the Military Youth Schools and the Communist Youth League (CYL) at the junior and middle-school levels. Senior schools are required to work more directly with the armed forces to combine general classroom activities with military training and to establish dedicated courses.

Beyond school education, all levels of government are also required to include NDE in their economic and social development plans and to educate their employees in national defense. The CYL, Women's Federation and trade unions are also

commanded to play a part. Even private enterprises are expected to combine NDE with political education and cultural and sports activities when training personnel. Residents and village committees are also supposed to include NDE in activities for building 'socialist spiritual civilisation'. Cultural organizations are expected to cooperate closely. Television, for example, is called on to broadcast special programs for NDE and on patriotic memorial days. Reduced prices and free tickets are provided when NDE activities take place at the tombs of martyrs, revolutionary sites and museums, science and culture galleries and theme parks.

One of the most visible manifestations of this extra-curricular activity is the creation of a NDE Day, to take place on the third Saturday in September every year. This was selected because it fell close to the date when China was forced to sign a humiliating treaty with 11 foreign powers after the crushing of the Boxer Rebellion in 1901. The first NDE Day was held on September 15, 2001. Just four days after the 9/11 attacks on the United States and as China was about to join the WTO, around 1,000 students from 29 universities and colleges in Beijing gathered in the ruins of the former Imperial Palace that had been destroyed by British and French troops in 1860.

The Role of Military and Paramilitary Institutions

The PLA and its associated paramilitary organizations are also important institutions for designing and implementing NDE. As stated above, the PLA plays a leading role by being involved in the drafting of the NDEL and the guidelines for NDE. The 2002 *White Paper on China's National Defense* that more than 200,000 officers had already been involved at that time in extending NDE from higher education to schools, and that over 30 million students had received training since 1985.²²

This supports the view of those observers of China's military who are skeptical about the assumption that its evolution as a more professionalized fighting force is the

²² *White Paper on China's National Defense*, State Council, 2002, Online: <http://english.people.com.cn/90001/90776/90785/7336375.html>

same as the creation of a de-politicized 'national' army.²³ China's 2015 defense white paper leaves little doubt about this when it states that the 'first priority' of the PLA is 'ideological and political building'. This is said to involve the tasks of carrying forward 'core socialist values' and working to cultivate 'a new generation of revolutionary service personnel of noble soul, competence, courage, uprightness and virtue, and ensure that the armed forces will resolutely follow the commands of the CPC Central Committee and the CMC at all times and under all conditions...'²⁴

The way in which the PLA propagates militarism can be seen in a wide array of activities that support NDE. Media coverage of anti-piracy operations by the navy under UN auspices in the Gulf of Aden, for example, presents figures for citizens to emulate in the form of heroic images of marines posing in black combat fatigues and elaborate body armor, bristling with sophisticated firearms. The PLA also produces and sponsors cultural products, such as television dramas focusing on the Anti-Japanese War, military toys and video games.²⁵

Developments in military doctrine also reinforce NDE by promoting the structural integration of the PLA into society, driven by an updated version of the Maoist doctrine of 'people's war'. As the purpose of this is to mobilize the population to fight modern wars under conditions of informatization it has a role in shaping the school curriculum and the career plans of university graduates in ways that encourage warrior activities. Since the doctrine was updated to making preparations for 'maritime people's war under modern conditions' in 2006, it has become even more firmly embedded in themes that are central to nationalistic discourse, such as unification with Taiwan and asserting control over disputed maritime territories. Events like the Olympic opening ceremony and the September 2015 military parade

²³ Specialists on the PLA remain skeptical about the degree to which professionalization leads to de-politicization. See, for example, David Shambaugh, *Modernizing China's Military: Progress, Problems and Prospects*, Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press (2002), pp. 12-17.

²⁴ *China's Military Strategy*, State Council, 2015. Online: http://eng.mod.gov.cn/Database/WhitePapers/2015-05/26/content_4586713.htm (accessed 6 November 2015).

²⁵ Naftali, Orna, 'Marketing War and the Military to Children and Youth in China: Little Red Soldiers in the Digital Age', *China Information*, Vol. 28, No. 1, pp. 3025.

also symbolize the integration of the military and civil society, summed up by the slogan 'Army and people unite as one person, see who under heaven can oppose' (军民团结如一人试看天下谁能敌).²⁶

The propagation of such values and practices is further supported by the work of the paramilitary organizations. The largest of these is the People's Militia, which is currently being streamlined through a reduction from 10 to 8 million personnel. It is also the oldest, having originally been formed by local communities for protection in the absence of effective central government in the dynastic era. Appropriated and reconfigured by the CCP during the Civil War and the War Against Japan, after 1949 it was given the task of providing support for combat operations and helping to maintain social order under the command of military organs. Its current reform involves an upgrading of weaponry and equipment to make it more efficient as its responsibilities move from rural areas to cities and along communication lines and in other key areas.²⁷

Like the PLA, the militia reinforces CCP legitimacy by pursuing goals linked to cleansing the nation of the shame inherited from the 'Century of Humiliation' (1849-1949). Given the current salience of disputes over maritime territories, the maritime militia play a specially significant role. Looking back with pride on the role they played in past armed conflicts, such as the confrontation with the South Vietnamese navy over the Paracel Islands in January 1974, they now coordinate with the China Maritime Surveillance force, which was established in 1998 with around 10,000 personnel and 400 patrol vessels and its own fleet of aircraft. In 2013 this was merged with the maritime section of the Public Security Border Brigade, a paramilitary force under the Ministry of Public Security, and renamed the China Coast Guard. Its vessels appear frequently in the Chinese media at the forefront of attempts to assert control over maritime territories claimed by Japan and Southeast Asian states. All of these maritime paramilitary organizations now fall under the remit

²⁶ Banners seen by the author in Shanghai in September and December 2015.

²⁷ 'Structure and Organization of the Armed Forces', Ministry of National Defense of the PRC. Online: <http://eng.mod.gov.cn/ArmedForces/reserved.htm> (accessed November 11, 2015).

of the State Oceanic Administration of the Ministry of Land and Resources, which invests in propaganda projects such as the eight-part 2011 television documentary *Ocean Bound* (走向海洋), presenting a dramatic historical narrative of China as a great maritime power.²⁸

The other paramilitary organisation deployed for NDE is the People's Armed Police (PAP). Created in 1983, it has come to play a particularly significant role in breaking down the barrier between the military and society because it is made up largely of soldiers who were demobilized as part of the downscaling of the PLA under the program of military modernization initiated by Deng Xiaoping. Overall, some 14 divisions were re-allocated to the PAP, which now numbers around 660,000 personnel. This practice of hiving off demobilized soldiers into paramilitary organizations and dispersing them throughout society may be repeated if the plan to reduce the size of the PLA by 300,000 personnel, announced by Xi Jinping at the September 2015 parade, is put into practice.

The NDE system thus combines Party, State, military and paramilitary organizations into a pyramid of power. Directives concerning general content and principles are issued from the top and adapted to circumstances by local organizations, with the military and paramilitary organizations playing a role in implementation. An example of how this works in practice can be seen from the February 2011 decision by the Hunan NDE Committee to extend its activities beyond the general school curriculum into areas such as summer camps. This required the development of new teaching materials for use by schools, cadres and the militia, and the selection of a number of model NDE schools to act as pioneers. The provincial propaganda bureau called on the professional military personnel to lecture the militia on how to focus its efforts more on NDE and to emphasize the need to expand its presence in private enterprises.²⁹

²⁸ Also published in book form by CCTV-1, *走向海洋* (*Ocean Bound*), Beijing: haiyang chubanshe, 2012.

²⁹ '国防教育纳入小学初中教学计划' ('Bringing National Defense Education into the Teaching Plan for Early Junior School Learning'), *潇湘晨报* (*Xiaoxiang zhenbao*), 17

Militarism as an element of ‘composite ideology’

Having outlined the contents and organizational structure of NDE it is possible to explore in more detail the way in which it is used to cultivate militarism as part of the CCP’s broader composite ideology. Under Reform and Opening this rests to a large degree on successful economic development. Yet it also relies to an increasing degree on nationalism. This has especially been the case since the launching of the Patriotic Education Campaign in response to the domestic upheavals of 1989 and the collapse of socialism in the Soviet Union and Eastern Europe. Chapter 7 of the NDEL explicitly stipulates that one of the tasks of NDE is to disseminate ‘patriotic spirit’ (爱国主义精神) as part of the Patriotic Education Campaign.³⁰

This political function is elaborated on further when Chinese educationalists explain that the NDEL is a response to concerns that the patriotic consciousness of young people was being eroded by the spread of the ‘socialist market economy’. This, they maintain, was already becoming apparent in the 1980s, as memories faded of the threats from imperialism that had shaped the mentality of previous generations. It presented a more serious problem when the conflicts in Iraq and the Balkans and the bombing of the Chinese embassy in Belgrade in the 1990s indicated that war was never far away and that hegemony and great power politics were continuing to grow.³¹ Such concerns go some way towards explaining why the NDEL was passed

February 2011. Online: (<http://xxcb.rednet.cn/show.asp?id=1078649>)

³⁰ Despite the salience of NDE, it is interesting that it has been a blind spot in studies of patriotic education. A particularly striking example is Wang Zheng’s excellent survey of the topic, *Never Forget National Humiliation: Historical Memory in Chinese Politics*, New York: Columbia University Press, 2012. The cover of this book features school children saluting in front of a blackboard on which is written the slogan ‘Don’t Forget National Humiliation, Strengthen Our National Defense’ (勿忘国耻，强我国防) but NDE is not mentioned in the text.

³¹ 陈云金 吴忠国 (Chen Yunjin and Wu Zhongguo), ‘坚持创新，探索高等学校加强国防教育的途经’, (‘Uphold Innovation, Explore the New Route for Strengthening National Defense Education in High Schools’), in 廖文科 (Liao Wenke) (ed.), *新的理论视野 - 全国普高等学第三届国防教育学术研讨会文集* (*Outlook on New Theory –*

just eight months before China fully embraced globalization by acceding to the World Trade Organization (WTO).

Further contextual evidence for understanding the political function of militarism can be derived from the fact that the NDEL was also passed just two months before the CCP made the transition from a revolutionary party to a ruling party by expanding its membership to include a much broader range of interest groups. This shift was first announced by General Secretary, Jiang Zemin, on 1 July 2001, when he listed the 'advanced elements' of socialism as including the founders and technical staff of non-publicly owned high technology enterprises, managerial and technical staff of foreign-invested enterprises, and the self-employed. Most sensitive was the opening of Party membership to private entrepreneurs.³² This new social order was ratified with the amendment of the CCP constitution at the 16th National Congress in November 2002 and can be seen as a countermeasure to the decline of the CCP's organizational base under the 'socialist market economy'.³³

NDE also plays a role in building the PRC's composite ideology by confirming that the military remains subordinate to the leadership of the CCP. Mao's principle that 'the Party controls the gun' is thus established on the third page of the first year textbook for primary-middle schools. There is also an explanation of the constitutional structure under which all matters related to the military and national defense are coordinated and implemented by the CCP's CMC, Central Committee, Politburo and Politburo Standing Committee. There is even an explanation of the arrangement by which the CMC of the State Council is in fact the same as the CMC of the Party, because it is composed of the same personnel. It would be wrong to see this model of the relationship between the CCP and the PLA as a form of civilian leadership, therefore, because it is the principle of the unity of the people and the military (军民结合) according to Mao's theory of 'people's war' that is stressed.

Papers of the Third Workshop on National Normal and High School National Defense Education): Beijing : Gaodeng jiaoyu chubanshe, 2006, pp. 7-8.

³² 人民日报 (*People's Daily*), 2 July 2001.

³³ Hiroshi Sato and Keiya Seto, 'The Changing Structure of Communist Party Membership in Urban China, 1988-2002', *Journal of Contemporary China*, 17(57), November 2008, pp. 653-672.

These ideological functions mean that it is somewhat misleading when Chinese commentators present NDE as similar to laws passed by other states. The parallels they point to are between the NDML and the mobilization laws enacted in Germany, Britain and the United States in World War One, by France in 1921, the 1793 General Mobilization Law of the Paris Commune or the national mobilization law promulgated by the Guomindang (GMD) regime in China during the War Against Japan.³⁴ There is an important difference between such laws and the NDE and NDML, because they were introduced in the shadow of major war. The Chinese laws were introduced when China's leaders had judged that a major war was not likely to break out.

Comparison of the NDEL with the United States 1958 National Defense Education Act is equally misleading. The American law is limited to the funding of defense-related science, technology and languages. It explicitly forbids the authorization of any department, agency, officer or employee of the United States government to exercise any direction, supervision, or control over the curriculum, program of instruction, administration, or personnel of any educational institution or school system.³⁵ This distinction is clearly lost on commentators who compare the US law to NDE at the same time as they advocate using the latter to prevent the growth of decadence and social tensions engendered by globalization and economic reform.³⁶

A more useful insight into the militaristic function of the Chinese laws can be gained from commentators who compare them to the laws of ancient Sparta. This is because they praise the Spartan system for being designed not only to familiarize the population with weapons and military ways of thinking, but also to further the ideological goal of propagating a 'spirit of appreciating the military' (尚武精神) in the

³⁴ Baidu, '国防动员法' ('National Defense Mobilization Law'):

<http://baike.baidu.com/view/3297642.htm>; **Gaogang**
<http://www.gaogang.gov.cn/guofang/gfdy/gfdy/lqfdy.html>)

³⁵ United States Congress, 'National Defense Education Act' (Public Law 85-864-Sept 2, 1958), p. 1582. Online: <http://www.scribd.com/fullscreen/57012400>).

³⁶ Chen Yunjin and Wu Zhongguo, op. cit., p. 9.

general population.³⁷ As a combined delegation from the Second Artillery and Wuhan University to the 2005 National Conference on NDE in Higher Education explains, building such a spirit is vital to combat the spread of decadence, to prevent further erosion of the values of self sacrifice and to counter the tendency for leading cadres to forget how economic development should be related to building a ‘rich country and powerful army’ (富国强兵).³⁸

The analogy with Sparta and the call to propagate a ‘spirit of appreciating the military’ (尚武精神) in the cause of building a ‘rich and powerful country’ also draws attention to the fact that NDE has its roots in a program to use militarism to promote modernization that has its origins in China long before the establishment of the PRC. Present-day advocates of NDE themselves trace it to Chinese political activists who were active in Japan at the start of the twentieth century.³⁹ Best-known is Liang Qichao (梁启超), who set out to construct a Chinese version of the *bushido* spirit.⁴⁰ Liang’s followers believed that the way to disseminate this spirit of ‘appreciating the

³⁷ 刘鹏 黄朝军 (Liu Peng and Huang Chaojun) , ‘从外国国防教育发展趋势谈加强我国国防教育的几点对策’ (‘Discussion of Some Points of Counter Policy for Strengthening Our Country’s National Defense Education from Developments and Trends in the National Defense Education of Foreign Countries’) in Liao Wenke (ed.), p. 49; See also 宁春勇 (Ning Chunyong) , ‘论大学生尚武精神教育’ (‘On Appreciating the Military Spirit Education for University Students’) , 魅力中国 , 109:3 , (2010) , p. 59.

³⁸ 张保国 (Zhang Baoguo), 廖斯宏 (Liao Sihong), 陈云金 (Chen Yunjin), ‘新时期我国国防教育面临的挑战及对策’ (‘The Challenges Faced by Our Country’s National Defense Education in the New Situation’) in Liao Wenke (ed.), pp. 37-38.

³⁹ Ning Chunyong, op. cit., p. 59

⁴⁰ 梁启超 (Liang Qichao), ‘中國之武士道序列’ (‘An Explication of China’s Bushido’), in 吴松 (Wu Song), 卢云昆 (Lu Yunkun), 王文光 (Wang Wenguang), 段炳昌 (Duan Bingchang) (eds.), 饮冰室文集 (Collected Café Works),_Vol. 4, Kunming: Yunnan jiaoyu chubanshe: 2001, pp. 2151-21.

military' was to emulate the policy of 'military-citizen education' (*gunkokumin kyōiku* 军国民教育) that had been introduced in Japan after the Meiji Restoration.⁴¹

This legacy can be seen in the project to build a 'spirit of appreciating the military' in NDE textbooks. Those for years 1 to 3 of primary-middle school, for example, present 'patriotic poetry and literature', while chapters on 'The Storm of War' contain stories of the tactics used to win battles in ancient China. Pictures of ancient Chinese warriors and war machines are presented as expressions of a 'spirit of appreciating the military' that stretches from the first dynasty to the present day. This is designed to inculcate an attitude in which:

The spirit of loving the army and practicing weapons indicates the patriotic consciousness of admiration for military preparation, ardently loving armaments, concern about national defense, supporting the military and national defense construction, and protecting the dignity and security of the country'.⁴²

This militaristic tradition is said to continue unbroken down to the present, with even Jiang Jieshi (Chiang Kaishek) acknowledged as the commander who led Chinese forces in tying down Japan's army. Ultimately the tradition is inherited by the CCP's leaders, under whom NDE becomes an extension of 'People's War' under high technology conditions. As a military training manual for middle-school students explains, former CCP General Secretary, Jiang Zemin, (who launched the Patriotic Education Campaign) was particularly enthusiastic about NDE as crucial for promoting a 'patriotic spirit', strengthening national (民族) solidarity and raising the

⁴¹ 瞿立鹤 (Qu Lihe) , '清末民初君国民教育思潮' (The Tide of Thinking About Military-Citizen Education in the late Qing and Early Republic), 师大学报 (*Shida xuebao*), No. 29, pp. 27-52.

⁴² 新时期学校国防教育课题组 (Editorial Team for New Period of School National Defense Education, *初中二年级国防教育*, (*National Defense Education for Year 2 Early Middle School*) , Beijing: Gaodeng jiaoyu chubanshe, 2003, p. 53.

quality of the whole people (全民素质).⁴³

Strategic myths and foreign relations

Further insights into the political function of militarism within the PRC's composite ideology can be seen by looking at the way in which NDE is used to propagate a number of strategic myths about the international situation that are designed to stimulate a crisis mentality. This is most notable in a bellicose anti-Western tone, expressed when one writer on NDE for middle schools reminds his audience:

War is not far away, we cannot but examine anew our security environment and examine anew our national defense environment. Although our security environment has had a big improvement of late, let us not mince words that some Western countries, when it comes to such domestic problems as human rights, nationalities, economics and Taiwan, have produced plenty of articles and engaged in containing our country, with the aim to 'Westernize' and 'divide' it'.⁴⁴

This antipathy towards the West becomes increasingly salient in NDE teaching materials for use in the higher years of education. A textbook for high schools in Hubei Province thus presents the US as a threat because it is seeking unipolarity, spreading democracy, imposing economic sanctions to open up markets, monopolizing high technology to exploit developing countries and spending massively on arms and forging alliances so that it can intervene in the domestic affairs of other states. The movement towards a peaceful, multipolar world is thus said to be an uncertain prospect, as other states come into conflict with a US that unilaterally intervenes around the world through a new kind of 'gunboat diplomacy'. Globalization is thus portrayed as distorted by the sharpening of contradictions between hegemonic powers and between the North and the South, the deepening of

⁴³ 李明 (Li Ming) , *中学生军训教育 (Military Training for Middle School Students)*, Guangzhou: Jinan daxue chubanshe, 2004, p. 4. See also articles 2 and 3 of the NDEL.

⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 6.

conflicts between nationalities, and the growth of problems of a global nature. The US is accused of making this situation worse by using the 'War on Terror' as an excuse to gain the cooperation of other big powers in maintaining its hegemony and build its presence in Central Asia and secure a geostrategic advantage in Eurasia and the Western Pacific.⁴⁵

Associated with the myth of an anti-Chinese West is the presentation of Taiwan as a threat. The chapter on 'military knowledge' in the first-year volume of the 2008 textbook for junior-middle school, for example, demonizes the island's Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) and its leader, Chen Shui-bian, who then held the Presidency in Taipei. The GMD is again presented in a remarkably positive light, with former leaders Jiang Jieshi and Jiang Jingguo (Chiang Ching-kuo) applauded for having never questioned that Taiwan is a part of China. This is in accordance with the rehabilitation of the party after its then chairman, Lien Chan (Lian Zhan), signed the landmark agreement on cooperation with CCP General Secretary Hu Jintao in 2005. The Anti-Secession Law that was introduced that year to set out the conditions under which force will be used against Taiwan can thus be presented as evidence of China's commitment to 'peaceful unification' and its peaceful rise to great power in accordance with Mao's theory that the CCP's use of force is always 'just' (正义) because it is always used to oppose 'unjust' (非正义) war.⁴⁶

These strategic myths are further constructed by defining the national territory in a way that challenges the territorial claims of many of China's neighbors. The first-year textbook for junior-middle school thus describes the 'yellow' (continental) territory as including 120,000 square kilometers of India's Arunachal Pradesh, south of the 'illegal' McMahon line. It goes on to explain that continental China also faces threats from religious extremism, international terrorism and separatism, within which the

⁴⁵ 陈云金 沈友生 (Chen Yunjin and Shen Fasheng), *高校国防教育教程 (第二版) 理工大学出版社 (National Defense Education Curriculum for High School (Second Edition))*, Wuhan: Ligong daxue chubanshe, 2008.

⁴⁶ 国防教育编委会 (Editorial Committee for National Defense Education), *国防教育知识普及读本 (初中一年级) (General Reader in National Defense Education Knowledge)*, (Junior Middle School Year 1).

'separatist' movement in Taiwan poses the greatest danger. This makes it essential to have a strong army, which has proved its mettle in the past through the 'great victories' in the Korean War, the 1962 conflict with India, and the 1969 clash with the Soviet Union. Again, this history is taken to show that China only uses force for just causes. The 1979 invasion of Vietnam is accordingly explained as a response to the expulsion of ethnic Chinese from that country and as a way of helping other countries to resist invasion.⁴⁷

More pertinent for explaining the link between militarism and the heightening of tensions over China's maritime territorial disputes is the description of the 'blue territory' that includes not only Taiwan but also the islands in the East and South China Seas that are claimed by China's neighbors. The Chinese status of these is explained by a historical narrative that is consistent with the current emphasis on naval power that is being promoted in defense doctrine, the mass media and broader public discussion, according to which China was a great maritime nation until it was reduced to a weak, 'semi-colonial' and 'semi-feudal' society by feudal regimes that lacked an awareness of the importance of the sea and closed the country to the outside world. Only when 'New China' was established in 1949 was it realized that the sea is important for national survival and development, as shown by measures for the defense of the Paracel and Spratly Islands against Vietnam since the early 1970s.

China's sovereignty and jurisdiction over its 200 mile Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ) and continental shelf is said to have been declared with the passing of the PRC's 1992 Law on the Territorial Sea and Contiguous zones. A map showing the 'nine-dash' line that claims the entire South China Sea appears in the textbook for second-year students.⁴⁸ The first-year text book asserts that some 1,500,000 square kilometers of territory are illegally occupied because China 'at present lacks the necessary means of administration'. This claim is strengthened by the geostrategic argument that the occupation of the blue territory by other states presents an

⁴⁷ Ibid., pp. 27-28.

⁴⁸ Editorial Team for New Period of School National Defense Education, *初中二年级国防教育*, (*National Defense Education for Year 2 Early Middle School*), Beijing: Gaodeng jiaoyu chubanshe, 2003, p. 10.

obstacle to China's development because it is located on the sea-lanes linking China with West Asia and Africa and is rich in natural resources.

The above strategic myths are finally brought together with the call for a strong military and the priority of economic development and national indignation as part of the project to shape national psychology. This is summed up by a paragraph in the conclusion of the chapter on the national territory, which states:

For these reasons, the occupation and development of the beautiful and abundant maritime territory by other people is something that definitely cannot be tolerated by the Chinese nation. In order to protect our country's legal maritime rights, protect our country's maritime territory, we must not only increase our strength for maritime national defense, it is even more important and pressing that we strengthen the consciousness of maritime territory and maritime development of the whole people, strengthen our country's comprehensive power for maritime exploration and development to build the large and powerful maritime economy of the Chinese nation.⁴⁹

Analysis of NDE thus shows how the presentation of external threats and the construction of an expanded version of the national territory is typical of the way in which political elites in late-industrializing societies use strategic myths to mobilize the population by stimulating a sense of national crisis. This evidence should be taken into account by commentators who claim that China's recent assertiveness is due to the constraints imposed on its leaders by a growing popular nationalism from below.⁵⁰

Militarism and the Making of Tradition in the China Model

⁴⁹国防教育编委会 (Editorial Committee for National Defense Education), 国防教育知识普及读本 (初中一年级) (General Reader in National Defense Education Knowledge, (Junior Middle School Year 1), p.28.

⁵⁰ Christensen, Thomas J (2011), 'The Advantages of an Assertive China: Responding to Beijing's Abrasive Diplomacy', *Foreign Affairs*, March/April 2011, Vol 90, No 2; Wang, Jisi 'China's Search for a Grand Strategy: A Great Power Finds Its Way', *Foreign Affairs*, 90/2 (Mar/Apr 2011) pp. 68-79.

Given that NDE is government policy and supported by the CCP and the PLA it should be a part of any account of the China Model. The case for this is even more compelling when commentators on the Model acknowledge the threat posed to social stability by tensions that are typical of late-industrializing societies. These include mass internal migration to the cities, fears among the elite over decadence through the commercialization of culture, and growing job insecurity in the general population as State Owned Enterprises are exposed to market competition. Such problems are becoming more intense as politics moves from the doctrine of class struggle to tensions between new interest groups that want to hold on to power and excluded groups that increasingly resort to mass protests.⁵¹

Advocates of the China Model do not use the term ‘militarism’ (□国主□) when looking for a theory of stability in this situation. They do, however, resort to giving a central role to a hierarchical and authoritarian version of what they claim is a traditional social structure and consciousness. In a chapter on maintaining social order in Pan Wei’s book, for example, Fan Peng (樊鹏) states that it is traditional values that have allowed for a total form of political control that does not require a strong central power because it facilitates the integration of state officials into every part of China’s fragmented, family-based agricultural society. It is this tradition that allowed the CCP to control crime through a system of collective responsibility when it retreated to its base in Yan’an in the civil war. It then provided the model for the creation of public security committees in every town, village, enterprise and state organization when the PRC was established. With the addition of ideological mobilization through the Mass Line it was possible to reduce crime to a remarkably low level, using only three policemen for every 10,000 head of population.⁵² At present, however, this system is said to be coming under strain as emerging interest groups demand more centralized modes of policing to protect their growing wealth in an increasingly unequal society. ‘Rule by law’ has thus been accompanied by a deterioration of the relationship between police and citizens and a sharp rise in the

⁵¹ 张静 (Zhang Jing) , ‘利益组织化结构：非同质性内聚’ (‘The Structure of the Formation of Interest Groups: The Internal Consolidation of Different Qualities’), in Pan Wei (ed.), op. cit., p. 573.

⁵²Fan Peng, op. cit. pp. 455-495.

number of 'collective incidents' (群体性事件)

If tradition is to play such a central role in the China Model, however, it needs to be examined as an activity embedded in social practice, rather than the filling of a 'purely intellectualized "empty box"' with cultural nationalist content (to borrow an expression from the work of Kiri Paramore).⁵³ The ideological orthodoxy of Mao Zedong Thought, in particular, is heavily shaped by 'a kind of military romanticism derived from the Chinese tradition upon Leninist doctrine and Leninist organizational techniques', so that, '...military metaphors and military habits of thought permeate every aspect of Mao's mentality and his approach to virtually all problems'.⁵⁴ This militaristic tradition has played an important role in shaping the political institutions at the heart of the China Model. For Mao, it was not political power that grows out of the barrel of a gun, but 'all things', such as party organizations, cadres, schools, culture and mass movements. The army in Mao Zedong Thought is thus the 'chief component of state power' and revolutionary war is 'omnipotent'.⁵⁵

This militarism reached a high point with communalization in the 1950s and during the Cultural Revolution (1966-76), when the nation was called on to learn from the PLA. Under Reform and Opening, although Deng Xiaoping (himself a commissar and commander) downsized the PLA and reduced its role in politics, he quickly stifled calls for political reform by instituting the disciplinarian and authoritarian elements of Mao Zedong Thought in the form of the Four Cardinal Principles.⁵⁶ This set the context for the systematization of NDE to rise up the

⁵³ Kiri Paramore "'Civil Religion" and Confucianism: Japan's Past, China's Present, and the Current Boom in Scholarship on Confucianism', *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 74 (2015), p. 269.

⁵⁴ Stuart Schram, 'The Military Deviation of Mao Tse-tung', *Problems of Communism*, 1, 1964, pp. 52-53.

⁵⁵ Mao Zedong, 'Problems of War and Strategy', *Selected Works* (Vol. 1). Online: http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/mao/selected-works/volume-2/mswv2_12.htm#p1

⁵⁶ The Four Cardinal Principles are 'keep to the socialist road, uphold Party leadership, uphold the dictatorship of the proletariat and uphold Marxism-Leninism and Mao Zedong Thought'. See Deng Xiaoping, 'Uphold the Four Cardinal Principles', in *Deng Xiaoping Selected Works ((1975-1982)*, Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1984, pp. 166-191. On the relationship between the principles and

political agenda under Reform and Opening in the early 1980s, resulting in its codification as part of the Patriotic Education Campaign in the 1990s and early 2000s.

Looking at China's present leadership, it has been noted by at least one commentator that Xi Jinping has been a particularly enthusiastic supporter of NDE since he assumed the directorship of the Provincial National Defense Mobilization Committee of Zhejiang Province, when he was Party Secretary there (2002-7), earning him the nickname of the 'Military Hugging Secretary' (擁军书记).⁵⁷ He also has strong personal connections with the military, being the son of military commander and political commissar, Xi Zhongxun (习仲勋), and married to the celebrity military singer and President of the PLA Academy of Art, Peng Liyuan.

It is no surprise, therefore, to see militaristic themes in the latest version of the CCP's composite ideology, namely Xi's project of the the 'China Dream', a part of which is the 'Strong Army Dream'.⁵⁸ The significance of the September 2015 military parade has already been noted above. Candidates sitting examinations for Ideological and Political Theory are also expected to answer questions on how Xi's project for 'the great revival of the Chinese race' is linked to memorial days introduced under his leadership to commemorate victory in the War Against Japan,

nationalism see Christopher R. Hughes, *Chinese Nationalism in the Global Era*, London and New York: Routledge, p.13.

⁵⁷ 吳鳴 (Wu Ming), *習近平傳 (Xi Jinping Biography)*, Hong Kong: Wenhua yishu chubanshe, 2010, p. 17.

⁵⁸ 泉州国防教育网 (Quanzhou National Defense Education Website) , 13 March 2015, '习近平 : 深入实施军民融合发展战略' ('Xi Jinping: Deepen the Implementation of the Strategy of Developing the Integration of the Army and the People') http://www.qzgfjy.cn/content/2015-03/13/content_5058225.htm

the Nanjing Massacre and the sacrifices made by national martyrs.⁵⁹ Moreover, the need for NDE (along with the call to further integrate the military and civilian economies), is restated in the section of the Thirteenth Five-Year Plan that establishes measures for achieving balanced development.⁶⁰ Even the anti-corruption campaign is presented as the latest in a series of movements that go back to the CCP's wartime base areas.⁶¹ In the realm of foreign affairs authoritative academics also present Xi's signature 'One Belt, One Road' (OBOR) project as a mission to assert control over maritime territories and make China into a 'great sea power' (海洋强国) inspired by the thought of Alfred Thayer Mahan, the architect of American expansion at the turn of the twentieth century.⁶²

The future of Chinese militarism

At present, militarism is not as salient in China as it was in the period of collectivization in the 1950s or the Cultural Revolution. Yet NDE shows that attempts are being made to deploy it in new ways due to the fears over social dislocation that

⁵⁹ 田维彬(Tian Weibin), *考研思想政治理论：冲刺重点热点全析* (*Study for Thought and Political Theory Examination: Rapid Comprehensive Analysis of Important Points and Hot Points*), Beijing: Beihang University Press, 2015, p. 178.

⁶⁰ '中共中央关于制定国民经济和社会发展第十三个五年规划的建议' ('The CCP Centre's Resolution Related to the Thirteenth Five-Year Plan Determining the Civilian Economy and Social Development'), in *中共中央关于制定国民经济和社会发展第十三个五年规划的建议* 辅导读本 ('Guide to 'The CCP Centre's Resolution Related to the Thirteenth Five-Year Plan Determining the Civilian Economy and Social Development'), Beijing: Renmin chubanshe, 2015, pp. 30-31.

⁶¹ 陈挥(Chen Hui) and 王关兴 (Wang Guanxing), *中国共产党反腐倡廉史* (*History of the CCP Anti-Corruption Campaigns*), Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 2014.

⁶² See the opening chapter of 赵磊 (Zhao Lei) (a professor at the International Strategy Institute of the Central Party School in Beijing), *一带一路：中国的文明型崛起* (*One Belt, One Road: The Civilized Mode of China's Rise*), Beijing: CITIC Press, 2015, pp. 4-11. This boasts endorsements by Ambassador 吴建民 (Wu Jianmin), a popular writer on Chinese diplomacy and advisor to the Foreign Ministry and 林毅夫 (Justin Lin Yifu), former Chief Economist at the World Bank and now a professor at Peking University.

are also expressed by advocates of the China Model. Adopting concepts developed for analyzing processes of militarization in societies such as pre-1945 Germany and Japan does not mean that China will necessarily follow in their footsteps, however. This is because militaristic themes can be appropriated by a wide range of actors. As Oleg Benesch demonstrates in a ground-breaking analysis of the construction of the *bushido* tradition in Japan and its implications for China, these can range from fascists to internationalists.⁶³

As in other societies, the shape of militarism in China will be defined how such actors respond to internal and external shocks. A particularly serious problem for using NDE in such situations is how to make militarism interesting for a rising generation. School children are unlikely to be interested in topics such as discussions of the influence of Fichte, Kant and Hegel on the thought of Clausewitz that can be found in NDE textbooks. The same is true of the rising professional class, as illustrated by the story that appeared on Chinese social media of a young woman who emerged from an examination for a job in local government in January 2009, flummoxed and angered by questions about whether an AK47 is an automatic or semi-automatic rifle.

Advocates of NDE are unlikely to give up their cause in the face of generation change, however. Contributors to the 'Iron and Blood' on-line forum, for example, were incredulous that someone applying to be a civil servant could be ignorant of something that even a junior school student should know.⁶⁴ Yet Chinese commentators also recognize the need to make adaptations, such as reducing the role of the military and paramilitary in NDE to teaching military drill, leaving the rest of the curriculum in the hands of organizations concerned with tasks such as education and environmental protection.⁶⁵ It is even being suggested that cellphones can be used to disseminate NDE.⁶⁶

⁶³ Oleg Benesch, *Inventing the Way of the Samurai: Nationalism, Internationalism and Bushido in Modern Japan*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

⁶⁴ The discussion can be seen at *Tiexue shequ*, January 12, 2009, at: http://bbs.tiexue.net/post_3968019_1.html. Accessed November 12, 2015.

⁶⁵ Chen Yunjin and Wu Zhongguo, op. cit., pp. 10-11.

⁶⁶ 周晓彬 (Zhou Xiaobin), '以手机为平台加强高校国防教育的对策研究' ('Research on the Measures of Strengthening NDE with the Mobile Phone as the Platform'), *Journal*

In conclusion, if the China Model is entering a third stage, Chinese militarism is also entering a new phase.⁶⁷ The outcome is supposed to be a version that is compatible with the broader post-socialist, composite ideology of the China Dream and inoculates young people against the transformative influences of globalization. Only by treating the construction of tradition in this project more critically than is done by advocates of the China Model, is it possible to unravel some of the paradoxes of a state that promotes militaristic themes, practices and strategic myths alongside notions of 'peaceful rise' and Confucianist harmony.

of Heilongjiang College of Education, Vol. 34, No.7, July 2015, pp. 183-184.

⁶⁷ Following the periodization made by Suisheng Zhao in his article in this edition of the *Journal of Contemporary China*.