

3rd June 2015 Glasgow

The economic case for early and personalised support for parents with learning difficulties (LD)

Annette Bauer

PSSRU, Social Policy Department London School of Economics and Political Science

PSSRU (Personal Social Services Research Unit); part of LSE Health and Social Care





Decision makers need to know

- what people <u>need</u> and what they <u>want</u>
 - what services can meet those needs
- what staff and other <u>inputs</u> are employed to deliver those services
 - what are the <u>costs</u> of employing them
 - how to raise the funds to meet those costs
 - ... and importantly also:
 - what <u>outcomes</u> are achieved
- and whether those outcomes are worth the cost



Is it worth it?



Antidepressant medication

CBT

Primary care counselling

Interpersonal psychotherapy

Couple thera

Outcomes

Symptom alleviation

Interpersonal functioning

Social functioning

Employment

Quality of life

Cost savings

Lower use of health and social care services

Fewer out-ofpocket expenses

Greater economic productivity

Higher income

3. Cost-effectiveness? 2. Return on investment?



Why supporting parents with learning difficulties (LD)?

- At much higher risk of losing their children into care
- More likely to be involved in child protection cases: 15% to 22% of parents involved in child protection conferences and care proceedings have LD (Brandon et al 2009)
- Often LD not identified
- Parents with LD less likely to seek help (Cleaver & Nicholson 2008)
- Need for additional support as well as responsive mainstream services
- Evidence (from other areas) demonstrates costeffectiveness of early intervention (e.g. Allen 2011)



Is early and personalised support for parents with LD worth it?

Questions

- Is early and personalised support for parents with LD cost-effective and/ or does it achieve cost savings?
- Which types of support are likely to be cost-effective?
- What are the costs and economic consequences of different types of care packages
- What are the cost savings in particular in regards to preventing that child is removed from home
- => Research for Working Together with Parents Network (WTPN)



Our approach.. influenced by challenges to get information

(1) Case studies of projects that provide support to parents with LD

- Electronic survey with practitioners (semi-structured);
- Questions about parents' characteristics; resource inputs as part of a care package; outcomes achieved;
- Assigning unit costs to resource inputs and outcomes (= economic consequences);
- Other data sources for assumptions about duration and intensity of services

(2) Literature review

- Pragmatic
- Search for evidence more widely



Economic evidence (of some kind) for...

- …advocacy
- ...shared lives
- ...intensive family interventions
- ...public social partnership
- ...parenting programmes
- ...parenting training
- ...adult learning



Advocacy:

Costs of intervention £3,040; return on investment (ROI) 2.0

Advocacy means 'Taking action to help people say what they want, secure their rights, represent their interests and obtain services they need' Lewington & Clipson 2004, p4

Previous research by myself and colleagues on advocacy for parents with LD found

- Costs of advocacy ranged widely; average costs were £3,040 per case
- Return on investment of 2.0 from a government perspective i.e. £2 pound return for every pound invested;



<u>Advocacy:</u>

Costs savings linked to reduced safeguarding activities AND increased access to early intervention

- Possible reduction in safeguarding activities, care proceedings and arrangements, worth £720 per parent
- Possible economic benefits linked to increased access to early interventions, worth £3,130
- Costs of advocacy: £32 per hour, mean length of intervention 95hrs
- Wide range of outcomes: mental wellbeing, placement stability, better relationships with children who had been previously removed, school attendance and performance

Bauer A, Wistow G, Dixon J, Knapp M (2014), Investing in advocacy for parents with learning disabilities: what is the economic argument?, *British Journal of Learning Disabilities*. doi: 10.1111/bld.12089



Advocacy: Early referral and targeting influences cost-effectiveness

Factors that positively *influenced* outcomes:

- Early referral: Good practice meant receiving a referral no later than the initiation of a Section 47 enquiry
- LD as main reason for parents' disengagement from child safeguarding process;

How advocacy made a difference...

- Raised professionals' awareness of and attitudes towards parents with LD;
- Improved joint working with parents;
- Increased time spent considering options and evaluating possible decisions;
- Improved interagency working around parents' needs.



Advocacy:

In our case study costs of care package £37,109, ROI 2.3

- Costs of care package £37,109;
- Included advocacy (£12,500); mother/baby foster placement (£8,400); costs for care proceedings (£4,825); tenancy and financial support incl. housing benefit support (£4,003); social services legal activity for children in need (£2,385); parenting capacity assessment (£1,273); family support worker (£923), social worker (£923)
- Return on investment: 2.3
- Savings based on annual costs of foster care between £83,585 and £85,045



Shared Lives Schemes:

Max. costs of intervention £37,024, ROI 1.7-2.4

- Here: parent and their child(ren) who need support and accommodation become a regular visitor to, or moves in with, a registered shared lives carer
- "Carers and those they care for are matched for compatibility and then develop real relationships, with the carer acting as 'extended family' " (Shared Lives Plus Ltd. 2011)
- Costs of shared lives: £485 to £712 per week and £25,220 to £37,024 per year (NAAPS 2009; Social Finance 2013; PSSRU 2014)
- Vast majority is payment to carer
- Return on investment from literature ranged between 1.7 and 2.4



Shared Lives Schemes PSSRU Case study: costs of care package £47,738, ROI 1.9

- Costs of care package: £47,738; this included shared lives support (£25,220), social worker (£11,400), special parenting (£5,850), health visitor (£3,380), core group meetings (£1,848)
- Return on investment: 1.9 based on prevented foster care and prevented expenditure for housing benefits for the period of a year
- Savings based on annual costs of foster care between £83,585 and £85,045 and cost of housing support £3,744



Intensive family interventions:

Wide ranging costs and (unrealistically?) high ROI

- = **Care coordination** approach: key worker works with a range of agencies to provide a period of intensive support for high risk families often with the aim to prevent children's entry into care (e.g. McDermid and Holmes 2013)
- Costs for this support ranged widely between £5,140 and £23,000 (excluding accommodation);
- Return on investments for troubled family programmes ranged widely and were arguably unrealistic in size (based on savings for family eviction)
- E.g. Flint et al 2011 estimate at 8.0; and DCSF (2009) estimate of up to 25 for family intervention programme



Intensive family interventions: Costs of care package £32,427; ROI 2.6-2.7

Child disability social worker (from case study)

- Cost of care package (excluded were costs of service related to child disability) £32,427; this included costs of child disability social worker (£7,349), family support worker (£5,400), care proceedings (£4,825), child in need support (£4,238), advocacy (£4,263), health visitor (£2,600), midwifes (£2,600), CBT (£930), adult learning disability team (£134), befriending (£88)
- Return on investment: 2.6

Valuing parent support service (from Tarleton et al 2011)

- Cost of intervention was £8,450; costs of care package were not evaluated
- Return on investment 2.7



Family Support Public Social Partnership: Costs of care package £42,219, cost savings??

- Works with parents with LD and their families to enable them to access services in their homes and in the community; consultative, asset based approach in which local networks and resources are identified and utilised
- Costs of care package: £42,219; this included the support by PSP (£1,100), care proceedings (£4,825), adoption (£27,000), advocacy (£4,263), welfare advice and housing benefits support (£4,003), social group (£88), health visitor (£260), midwifes (£260), social worker (£220), voluntary sector worker (£200)
- No immediate cost savings because child was given to adoption but this was considered the more appropriate care arrangements; likely that positive long-term outcomes were achieved for child and parent bit difficult to evidence



Parenting programmes, training and support

Positive Parenting Programme (Glazemakers et al 2013)

- =Adaptation to Triple P
- Longer sessions, more time for relationship and trust building, additional contact; additional elements of support
- Parents achieved some positive outcomes
- Costs were not measured but likely to be higher than costs of Triple P

Training interventions for parents with LD (Cochrane review)

- Different types, common aim to help parents protect their children from harm, and prevent their children being removed from home
- Improvements in: child health knowledge, recognising dangers, home precautions, child care routines, maternal child interaction
- Costs not evaluated

Parenting programmes to address specific problems relevant for parents with LD e.g. child abuse, child behaviour, child (learning) disability (Cochrane review, economic studies e.g. Bonin et al)

More likely to be cost-effective if they reduce child behaviour problems



Adult learning approaches

McGaw et al 2002, Booth and Booth 2003, McConnel et al 2008

- For mother with LD, 12wks intervention; involved group meeting as well as one-to-one support, focused on individual goals and strengthening social relationships
- Interventions achieve improved psychological wellbeing and social contacts, quality of life and self-confidence to access support



Befriending programmes or home visiting

Fraser et al 2000; Mead et al 2010

- Targeted at high risk populations
- Reduction in social isolation and improved mental health



Return on investment (ROI) for early and personalised support for parents with LD

Intervention	Cost of care package	Return on investment (range)	Sources
Advocacy	£37,109	2.0 to 2.3	Bauer et al 2013, case study
Shared Lives	£47,738	1.7 to 2.4	NAAPS 2009, Social finance 2013, PSSRU 2014, case studies
Intensive family interventions	£32,427	2.6 to 2.7	Case studies
Public Social Partnership	£42,219	None	Case study



Challenges and limitations

- Evidence on long-term support from case studies and literature; evidence on short-term support from literature only
- Cost of care package versus costs of intervention
- Missing information about resource use and costs
- Mismatch units of costs from the literature and units reported in case studies
- Different time periods covered (12-24 months)
- Return on investment in case studies based primarily on annual costs of foster care provision
- A range of additional outcomes could not be transformed in monetary terms ('monetised')



Challenges and limitations

- Evidence on long-term support from case studies and literature; evidence on short-term support from literature only
- Cost of care package versus costs of intervention
- Missing information about resource use and costs
- Mismatch units of costs from the literature and units reported in case studies
- Different time periods covered (12-24 months)
- Return on investment in case studies based primarily on annual costs of foster care provision
- A range of additional outcomes could not be transformed in monetary terms ('monetised')



Implications and considerations

- Early and personalised support for parents with LD likely to achieve improved outcomes and cost savings i.e. to be cost-effective
- BUT.. likely to depend on timing of referral and targeting groups of parents
- Data of local projects and partnerships often poor and not collected collaboratively
- Urgent need for improving collaborative data collection practice: information on key resource inputs and outcomes



THANK YOU!

Please get in touch a.bauer@lse.ac.uk