Catherine Campbell and C. McLean

Locating research informants in a multi-ethnic community: ethnic identities, social networks and recruitment methods

Original citation:

Copyright © 2003 Taylor & Francis Group.

This version available at: http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/2807/
Available online: October 2007

LSE has developed LSE Research Online so that users may access research output of the School. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LSE Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain. You may freely distribute the URL (http://eprints.lse.ac.uk) of the LSE Research Online website.

This document is the author’s pre-publication manuscript version of the journal article, and does not incorporate any revisions agreed during the peer review process. You are advised to consult the publisher’s version if you wish to cite from it.

http://eprints.lse.ac.uk
Contact LSE Research Online at: Library.Researchonline@lse.ac.uk
Locating research informants in a multi-ethnic community: Ethnic identities, social networks and recruitment methods.

Carl A. McLean, Researcher, Gender Institute, London School of Economics
Catherine M. Campbell, Reader in Social Psychology, London School of Economics

*Catherine Campbell
Social Psychology
London School of Economics
Houghton St
London WC2A 2AE
Tel: 020 7955 7701
Fax: 020 7955 7565
Email: c.campbell@lse.ac.uk

*corresponding author
Acknowledgements

Our greatest debt in this paper is to Flora Cornish, who edited the paper, and provided extensive critical comments and suggestions on an earlier version of the manuscript.

We acknowledge the financial support of the Health Education Authority (now the Health Development Agency) (HEA/HDA) who funded the research. Pamela Gillies, former HEA research director, played the lead role in setting up the HEA's social capital and health research, and her intellectual leadership and support is gratefully acknowledged. Particular thanks to Moira Kelly, former HEA Research Manager, who played a key role in formulating the research proposal, in guiding the early stages of the research process and in chairing the Project Advisory Committee. It was Moira's idea that we should write this paper. Sarah Allen, Claudette Edwards, Antony Morgan and James Nazroo also served on our Project Advisory Committee, and their support is gratefully acknowledged.

Thanks must also be given to all those individuals who helped us in accessing research participants in our area of interest, without whom methodological reflections would not have been possible at all - in particular Bob Baker, African-Caribbean Outreach Worker, Luton Borough Council. Most of all, we would like to thank our team of research assistants whose reflections in a post-interview debriefing session allowed us to identify the different patterns that emerged in recruitment strategies within and between our communities of interest. These are Ambreen Shah, Claire O'Neill, Manzoor Khan and Shane Doheny. Thanks also go to Maria Macintyre and Nazreen Ali for their assistance.

Despite our debt to these agencies and individuals, however, we emphasise that the ideas expressed in this paper are the personal views of the authors, and do not represent the views of the HEA/HDA, members of the Project Advisory Committee or other colleagues who have assisted us in various ways.
Locating research informants in a multi-ethnic community: Ethnic identities, social networks and recruitment methods.

Abstract

Objectives: Recruitment of informants can ‘make or break’ social research projects, yet this has received little research attention. Drawing on our recent qualitative research into health and social capital in a multi-ethnic neighbourhood in South England, this paper presents a detailed analysis of the complexities encountered in recruiting research informants who described themselves as African-Caribbean, Pakistani-Kashmiri and White English.

Methods: Three methods of recruitment were used: 1) advertisements and articles in local media, 2) institutional contacts through local voluntary organisations and 3) interpersonal contacts, referrals and snowballing. We compare and contrast the experiences of ethnically matched interviewers who conducted research amongst the three aforementioned ethnic groups. These experiences were recorded by means of lengthy interviewer ‘debriefing questionnaires’ that focused on factors that had served to help or hinder them in finding research participants. These questionnaires formed the basis of a discussion workshop in which the interviewers and researchers sought to identify the factors impacting on the recruitment process.

Results: Our findings suggest that local advertisements and media contact worked best for recruiting members of the white English community in our South English town. Interpersonal contacts were crucial in recruiting Pakistani-Kashmiri informants. Institutional contacts were the most useful way of accessing African-Caribbean individuals.

Conclusion: We conclude that local ethnic identities and social networks produce qualitatively different responses to recruitment attempts in different communities. Such differences necessitate the employment of a range of recruitment methodologies and detailed formative research in a target community before commencing recruitment.

Keywords: ethnicity, recruitment, participation, social research, sampling
Locating research informants in a multi-ethnic community: Ethnic identities, social networks and recruitment methods.

INTRODUCTION

In this paper we report on our experiences of recruiting research interviewees from three different ethnic groups in a multi-ethnic South English town. The broader context of our study is the current concern with ethnic health inequalities in England. Recent government policy documents have emphasised the importance of the participation of minority ethnic groups - both in health-related initiatives and in community life in general - as a means of reducing health inequalities\(^1\). Our study sought to examine factors that might help or hinder such participation.

In the course of conducting our empirical research, we soon realised that the differential experiences that interviewers were having in their task of recruiting research informants, could also serve as important sources of information about different patterns of participation in local community affairs - i.e. that the factors hindering or promoting participation in a local community context also impinged upon recruitment of informants to participate in the research project.

This paper outlines differing methodologies employed in recruitment in the interests of providing a useful case study for those seeking to conduct research in multi-ethnic communities. We will argue that the methodological challenges facing those who seek to access different communities result from the processes whereby ethnic identities and coalitions are constructed, and from the characteristics of local social networks - i.e. that recruitment issues reflect wider social dynamics. We hope that our experiences will be useful for researchers planning to engage in social research across different ethnic groups in England, as well as highlighting the high degree of flexibility and adaptability that is needed to conduct such research within British minority ethnic groups.
Ethnic minority recruitment – an overview

Despite its centrality to any social research project, recruitment of informants has received surprisingly little attention in the literature. Its salience is underlined by McCormick et al\textsuperscript{2}, who show that it is often recruitment problems that underlie requests for additional time or resources in the conduct of a research project. The significance of participant recruitment is addressed in research across a broad range of disciplines, such as social work\textsuperscript{3}, nursing research\textsuperscript{4}, psychotherapy\textsuperscript{5} and particularly population health survey work\textsuperscript{6,7,8,9,10}. However, there is a scarcity of material dealing with methodological issues of participant recruitment as a ‘stand alone’ issue. Rosenthal & Rosnow\textsuperscript{11,12} provide a notable exception, reviewing empirical literature to construct a ‘map’ of volunteer characteristics that helps researchers to identify those most likely to volunteer.

Furthermore, existing literature on recruitment has tended to consider research participants as a homogenous category, without paying attention to the stratifications, such as ethnicity, that may exist among potential participants, and the impact of such differences on recruitment success. Such matters are particularly pertinent in health-related social research in the context of the health inequalities faced by ethnic minority groups. There is an urgent need for more research to examine the effectiveness of tailoring recruitment strategies to varying populations\textsuperscript{13} and, frequently, there is little information to hand for researchers on how to access members of minority ethnic communities\textsuperscript{14}.

Most of the literature on participation and recruitment of minority groups in health research focuses on research in North America, and there are fewer studies looking at issues of ethnic recruitment in a British context\textsuperscript{15}. Those British studies that do exist\textsuperscript{16,17} tend to focus on issues such as how best to define ethnic groups for large survey studies, or on how to ensure that large-scale survey researchers find representative samples of hard-to-reach groups. There is little systematic attempt to explain recruiting outcomes, and people’s motivation to participate in research, in terms of broader patterns of local identification and networking.

The reduced UK focus on recruiting minority groups for health research reflects the differing emphases of government health policies in the US and the UK. In March 1994, the US National Institutes of Health (NIH) specified that women and members of ethnic minority groups should be included as research subjects in all NIH-funded projects involving human
participants, unless a clear and compelling rationale justified their exclusion. This built on previous NIH workshops on Health Behaviour Research in Minority Populations. Consequently, knowledge about effective and culturally-sensitive means of contacting, recruiting and retaining minorities as research participants has become an important resource for researchers wishing to conduct NIH-funded projects. While inclusion of British minority ethnic groups is an explicit aim of social policy and institutional funding in the UK, such inclusion is not enshrined in funding legislation as is the case in the US, nor has it received the same amount of attention.

The US health literature on recruiting minority ethnic participants highlights a number of important issues centring on increasing the absolute numbers of people of minority ethnic backgrounds in health research. The literature has focused on the following themes: inclusion of ethnic minorities due to their under-representation in health and health promotion; attempts to achieve better representativeness of an increasingly ethnically diverse population base; the ethnic composition of research teams (that allegedly increases the likelihood of minority ethnic volunteer participation due to the same-ethnicity presence of research staff); the nature and location of recruitment sites and cultural sensitivity and competence in recruitment methodology design; and historically-shaped resistance to participation in health research itself.

The concern of this literature - to increase the representation of minority ethnic groups in health research projects - is commendable. However, little attention is given to the actual nature of ‘participation’ itself. That is to say, participation is seen as a transparent or homogenous concept that applies to all participants in a similar and equal manner. The minority ethnic recruitment literature has not fully addressed how factors of cultural and ethnic identity may influence the extent to which, or the ways in which, potential minority ethnic volunteers may or may not participate. To address this question, communities must be understood as socio-cultural entities, in which cultural values and social mores play a large role in determining the responses to invitations to participate in a research project. Having appropriate cultural knowledge about specific ethnic communities’ beliefs and values can thus prove pivotal to the accessing of research participants. In this interest, we propose to view participation through a socio-cultural lens. Such consideration escapes the frame of reference of research that focuses simply on the numerical increase of minority ethnic communities in research without interrogating recruitment methodology itself.
In this paper we seek to add to the insights of the ethnic minority recruitment literature in a number of ways. Firstly, we seek to examine how differing local dynamics may influence responses to invitations to participate in research, guided by a socio-cultural theoretical approach and utilising concepts of ethnic identity and interpersonal networks. Secondly, we provide a UK focus not apparent in the existing academic literature.

METHODS

Context of our recruitment observations: An overview of the research project

This research project comprised a follow-up of earlier exploratory work in the same town, which addressed the alleged relationship between social capital and health\textsuperscript{26}. The initial study called for attention to the ways in which social capital is created, sustained and accessed; and to the interaction of social capital with social axes of gender, age, socio-economic status and ethnicity. Accordingly, the second follow-up study aimed to examine factors affecting grassroots participation in local community networks by three ethnic groups, using the concept of ‘social capital’ as a frame of reference. The project was initiated in June 1999 following discussions with local health and community development workers and was funded by the former Health Education Authority.

In the first exploratory project, a collaborative research steering committee was established, which included the following members: the Director of Research of a local health authority, a local Health Action Zone evaluation officer, a lecturer from the local university health department, a local borough social inclusion officer, the Director of Community, Youth and Development department of the local borough council and the Chief Executive of the local borough council. The committee met on a regular basis to monitor progress of the research and drew attention to the ethnic communities that became the focus of the second, follow-up project (African-Caribbean, Pakistani-Kashmiri and White English). A similar level of input was conducted throughout the life of second follow-up project.

The very positive collaborations made with local health and community development practitioners, local government officials and university health specialists in the research
steering committee were pivotal to the project’s success. The contribution of local knowledge to framing the research questions and identifying appropriate ethnic groups was vital to the design and implementation of the project.

Sample

The research took place within a community spatially defined in terms of two geographically adjacent electoral wards. Electoral wards comprised our unit of analysis for two reasons: firstly, so that our research would be comparable with the spatial parameters used in our previous exploratory study. Secondly, wards represented the smallest geographical areas on which detailed local government census data could be found. Census data was important in this context, as we wanted to identify the areas of highest ethnic diversity of the town. The two ward areas also reflected the disproportionate number of minority ethnic people subject to social inequalities by also being the two areas of highest relative deprivation in the town, and indeed, the surrounding county (Jarman index score of 46 and 41 – within the 5% most deprived wards in England and Wales according to 1991 census data).

A stratified sample of 72 individuals was selected. The sample was stratified equally on dimensions of ethnicity, gender, age-group and participation in community organisations. The three ethnic groups selected were African-Caribbean, Pakistani-Kashmiri, and white English. Degree of participation was operationalised in terms of those who were members of one or more local community organisations and those who had no such affiliation at all.

Procedure

Semi-structured interviews comprised the data collection methodology. Potential informants were told: that this was a project about the factors that hinder or promote local participation by three ethnic groups; that the interview was three hours in undisturbed and continuous length; and that there was an incentive of £20 for their participation.

The interviews were carried out by a team of 6 researchers. As far as possible, interviewers were residents of our community of interest and were matched in terms of gender and
ethnicity with interviewees. Our male and female Pakistani-Kashmiri researchers were both fluent in English, Urdu, Punjabi and Bahari. Two white female researchers interviewed the white English women. A white male researcher interviewed the white English men. The African-Caribbean male research team leader (first author) interviewed both male and female African-Caribbeans and was resident in London. Each interviewer was asked to recruit 12 people matching their particular ethnic/gender group for participation in a three-hour interview (with appropriate adjustments made for the African-Caribbean and white female interviewers).

Three major methods of recruitment were employed. Firstly, advertisements were placed in local newspapers, in shop windows and on noticeboards at a variety of community facilities. Secondly, members of local voluntary organisations (some ethnically-specific) were approached as potential interviewees. Thirdly, informal referrals were sought through existing contacts in the community.

Generating data on the recruitment process

During the recruitment stage of the research, it became clear that interviewers of different ethnic and gender combinations were encountering different possibilities and constraints in their recruiting task - and that these experiences in themselves provided useful insights into our research topic: viz. the impact of ethnic identity on the likelihood of people participating in various aspects of community life. It was against this background that we asked interviewers to fill in lengthy questionnaires about their recruiting experiences, which then formed the basis of a workshop in which interviewers sought to build up a systematic account of similarities and differences in their experiences of the recruitment process. A great deal of information was generated, and it is the combination of written questionnaires and the transcribed workshop discussion that form the basis of the observations made here - contextualised against the broader background of some 7000 pages of data generated from project interviews themselves.
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The remainder of this paper examines the factors that influenced the process of recruiting members of three different ethnic groups (African-Caribbean, Pakistani-Kashmiri and White English). We have identified the six overarching factors below as those differentiating among the responses of each ethnic group to invitations to participate in the research. We suggest that it is differences in the ethnic identities and interpersonal networks of these three ethnic groups, revealed through the working of these six factors, which lead to our differing recruitment experiences in each group. Results are summarised in Table 1.

1. Informants’ organisational affiliation
2. Honorarium payment
3. Informants’ gender and age
4. Style of interview (length, semi-structured nature)
5. Institutional context of the research project
6. Previous experience of research

INSERT TABLE 1 SOMEWHERE AROUND HERE PLEASE

Three sub-sections follow, discussing the influence of these six factors on our recruitment experiences within each ethnic group in turn. Each section commences with an introduction to the recruitment procedure followed, and concludes with an integrative summary that contextualises our recruitment experiences within the substantive findings of our interview data. In our final concluding section, we shall seek to summarise the implications of these differences in terms of recruitment strategies and what this adds to our existing knowledge base.

Much has been written about the dangers of perpetuating unfounded stereotypes of ethnic identities and ethnic communities\textsuperscript{28}. Here we must emphasise that we are not seeking to make generalisations about ‘essential’ ethnic communities – such as ‘the African-Caribbean community in England’ or ‘Pakistani Kashmiri people in England’. Rather we seek to provide an account of our particular research experiences in one particular geographical location in the interests of highlighting the types of issues that may impact on participation of recruits,
and to highlight the way in which these factors might be linked to the way in which identities are constructed in particular settings. Furthermore, we are not assuming that even within our geographical area of interest people subscribed to common and stereotypical notions of ethnic identity. Even within this one geographical space, our research pointed to strong within-group differences in the way in which informants from different ethnic groups constructed their ethnic identities. Yet even despite these within-group differences, members of the African-Caribbean and Pakistani Kashmiri groups felt a strong sense of identification with their ethnic labels, a sense of socio-cultural affiliation with others who shared identification with these ethnic categories, and a sense of difference and separation from those who did not. (the White English situation was slightly more complex here, as will be discussed below). In short, within-group differences in ethnic identity construction did not obliterate peoples’ experience of between-group differences amongst different ethnic groups.

African-Caribbean

Historically, levels of African-Caribbean participation in local community activities have been low. Furthermore, African-Caribbean people constitute just under 5% of the population of our wards of interest, so the task of recruiting research informants in this community promised to be a great challenge. The research team leader began the task by approaching the range of local African-Caribbean focused organisations in our area of interest. These included black awareness and history groupings, Saturday schools, youth clubs, elderly centres and voluntary African-Caribbean development organisations, in addition to speaking with key personnel with African-Caribbean responsibilities employed within the statutory sector. These groupings were enthusiastic about the research, commenting that there had been little African-Caribbean focus in previous research in the town. Several members of these organisations agreed to serve as research participants, as a result of their perception that the research was timely and interesting. However, the number and membership of these organisations was relatively small, and organisational members complained of the difficulties that they had in mobilising members of the African-Caribbean community to participate in their particular organisation’s activities. Thus, a Black History event had not succeeded in
creating a database of more than sixty names, despite estimation that at least 1000 people of
African-Caribbean origin reside in the two wards of interest (according to 1991 census data).

Given the small membership of such organisations, it was necessary to put much effort into
gaining access to informal networks as a route to recruitment. Initial contact with a small
number of key statutory personnel with African-Caribbean responsibilities (such as African-
Caribbean community development workers) resulted in a wealth of background and
anecdotal information and a number of contacts. The research team leader then accessed
churches, schools and informal African-Caribbean social events in addition to attending many
meetings involving an African-Caribbean focus by either voluntary or statutory groups.
This was a time-intensive process, requiring flexibility in being available over evenings and
weekends, without this association and familiarity with the community, recruitment would
have been a very much more difficult process.

(1) Informants’ organisational affiliation

The research was positively received in the African-Caribbean community amongst members
of community or political organisations such as African-Caribbean development, awareness
and history promotion organisations. Recruitment through organisations was the most
effective method for reaching potential African-Caribbean informants, either through
organisation members identifying suitable leads, or through adverts or talks at the
organisation’s meeting place. Affiliates welcomed a research interest in African-Caribbeans
in the light of their perception that the African-Caribbean community had been marginalised
by the local borough council - both in terms of resources and in terms of viewing the
community as low down on the council priority list.

Secondly, and very importantly, we found that ethnic matching was particularly important for
the African-Caribbean community. In the context of a historical experience of
misrepresentation or lack of attention by outsiders, the African-Caribbean people we
approached were particularly appreciative that the team leader of the fieldwork was himself
of African-Caribbean background. We believe that the team leader’s ethnicity served as a key
determinant of people’s willingness to participate in the research, the quality of the data
produced in the interviews, and especially informants’ readiness to reflect critically on the strengths and weaknesses of the African-Caribbean community. The benefits of ethnic matching are discussed in the literature and while some authors argue that ethnic matching of interviewer with interviewee is not necessary, it is our belief that, in our particular setting, a non-African-Caribbean interviewer would have battled to recruit informants, and would not have been able to produce the richness of information that we obtained.

We believe our attention to ethnicity, in terms of (i) the research focus on the African-Caribbean community, and (ii) ethnic matching of interviewer and interviewee, was a crucial motivation for participation by organisational affiliates. Their positive response to our ethnic sensitivity resulted in their facilitating access to their organisation, its members, and non-organisational personal contacts.

(2) Honorarium

The role of the £20 honorarium as a recruitment incentive differed according to people’s organisational involvement. It appeared that, for organisationally affiliated participants, the perceived political relevance and intrinsic value of the research was a stronger motivating factor than the honorarium, whereas for those not affiliated to a community organisation, the £20 honorarium was a key incentive. Even where the honorarium did not serve as a primary motivating factor, it was greeted appreciatively. Several interviewees commented on the lack of payment, or even provision of refreshments, at previous community consultation exercises in which they had taken part.

Although important, the honorarium alone was not a sufficient incentive to participate to those people without organisational affiliation. This is demonstrated by the low response to our recruiting advertisements. Advertisements presumably rely mainly upon the offer of £20 as their incentive. A five minute slot on the local black radio show broadcast on Saturdays - in which the research manager outlined the aims of the research and called for volunteers - elicited no response at all. A mail shot to those on the database of a local ‘Black History’ month-long event elicited only a small response. Adverts in places of worship did not yield any significant response and the response to general adverts placed in local, community and student newspapers and newsletters was small. Thus, while the offer of £20 contributed to
people’s decisions to participate in the study, it needed to be backed up either by an interest in the research itself, or through personal referral.

(3) Informants’ gender and age

Accessing African-Caribbean men was easier than accessing African-Caribbean women of all age groups in our town of interest. Young men were relatively easy to access through local African-Caribbean youth clubs, which they tended to dominate numerically. There were few ‘formal’ or institutional spaces where young African-Caribbean women could be accessed in this manner outside of school where recruiting was ultimately conducted. In schools, initial access to pupils was facilitated through head members of staff and a short presentation given in a school assembly. Letters were handed out to form tutors of every class explaining the research and volunteers returned the forms with parental consent forms if they wished to take part. All interviews were conducted in pupils’ homes, with parents present in adjacent rooms.

Elder African-Caribbean men were principally recruited through a local West Indian club, a voluntary context that again tended to be dominated by African-Caribbean males. Elder female participants tended to be recruited through personal referrals, this time through representatives of African-Caribbean organisations and African-Caribbean community development workers, and then by snowballing on from these referrals.

Addressing elder participants in an appropriately respectful manner was important to the reception of the interviewer. Elder participants could sometimes be offended if not addressed by their title and surname throughout an initial meeting or interview, first names being taken as a sign of over-familiarity. The familiarity with such conventions conferred by ethnic matching helped our African-Caribbean interviewer to avoid such mistakes.

(4) Institutional context of research
Potential informants were ambivalent about the institutional context of the researchers (LSE). On the one hand, African-Caribbean participants appreciated the independence of the research from local health, borough council, and institutional contexts. On the other hand they could not easily identify who had precise ownership of the research, or with the notion of a university as an 'independent' research body. This puzzlement left people with a degree of uncertainty as to who their audience would be and what would be done with the final project report itself, which may have affected recruitment to a small degree.

(5) Impact of style of interview: time, open-ended questions

The length of the interview (three hours) was a major deterrent to participation. Elder people were particularly unenthusiastic about the physical prospect of sitting and talking for three hours and recruitment at a local West Indian elderly centre did not yield volunteers. Younger people said they would find it difficult to fit the interview into their busy lives, particularly for women who had child-care commitments.

However, those who did agree to be interviewed afterwards commented positively about the informal and relaxed style of our open-ended interview approach, comparing it favourably to previously experienced formal survey interviews in which people often had little rapport with the interviewer, and little opportunity to communicate the context of their views, or to express themselves in a style with which they felt comfortable. Many of our African-Caribbean interviewees felt that this mode of social expression was a vernacular of ‘African-Caribbean culture’, part of the idiom by which African-Caribbean people conduct social interaction.

(6) Previous research experiences

During the recruiting process, a few potential informants expressed cynicism about the value of research, commenting that while researchers had consulted African-Caribbean people in the past, this had still led to no perceivable benefits for the community. It is imperative that community members are aware of the remit of any research project in which they participate. Negative experience with research or unfulfilled expectations may well act as a disincentive
to participate in subsequent projects. Throughout the project, the research team emphasised that the project was not action research, but retained a primary academic focus. We stressed that tangible benefits in the short-term were not going to be accrued to those communities involved in the studies, but rather, the research would input into the long-term body of knowledge regarding how partnerships and participation involving minority ethnic communities should be framed.

**Relation of recruitment experiences to our substantive findings**

In summary, the African-Caribbean community seemed relatively dispersed and not easy to access, even for those African-Caribbean organisations ostensibly serving the community itself. Networking of the African-Caribbean community for personal referrals (particularly for women) was a time-intensive, painstaking but essential process. In this section, we contextualise our recruitment experiences within themes that emerged in the interview data, to interpret the relations between research participation, ethnic identity and social organisation in this specific community.

**Our African-Caribbean informants expressed strong feelings of exclusion and powerlessness in this particular community where they represented only 5% of the general population. This sense of alienation was reflected in very low levels of participation in community groupings and organisations.** This observation is confirmed by communication with other researchers in the locality, who commented on the relative conservatism of the African-Caribbean community in our town of interest. In the context of relatively stable employment in the industrial town, the African-Caribbean community has not had to be as strident as other more disadvantaged African-Caribbean communities. Local African-Caribbean organisations regularly had less than ten people turning up, some organisationally affiliated African-Caribbeans citing examples where they were the only black representatives to attend a meeting precisely tabled for the African-Caribbean community. Some informants felt that the African-Caribbean community had not historically organised effectively around African-Caribbean issues. We suggest that the absence of a wider black political identity may have reduced the likelihood of recruitment of African-Caribbean people on the basis of ethnicity. Where motivation to participate on the basis of a
politicised ethnicity was low, the incentive of the honorarium increased in relative importance.

Despite some demoralisation in the formal public realm however, African-Caribbean identity was seen as an extremely strong resource at the informal interpersonal level\textsuperscript{29}. This is reflected in our observations of the importance of personal recommendations in recruiting informants. Interpersonal networks thus served as important recruitment resources. Moreover, among organisationally affiliated African-Caribbean community members, who may draw on a more politicised ethnic identity, the ethnic focus and sensitivity of our project greatly encouraged participation.

The relative lack of community involvement among African-Caribbeans made recruitment, through both formal and informal networks, difficult. Recruiting in the African-Caribbean group took the longest time, and involved spending months in the community, getting to know local people well enough for personal contacts to bear fruit. This was particularly true for African-Caribbean women who were not as evident in institutional and voluntary sites such as youth clubs and an elderly centre. Building up a relationship with the ethnic community therefore was essential in order to access informants.

\textbf{Pakistani-Kashmiri}

Both our male and female Pakistani-Kashmiri researchers (themselves of Pakistani origin) had already established links with the ethnic communities of interest in the two wards. This enabled the researchers to facilitate recruitment through existing networks. The Pakistani-Kashmiri ward population was greater than that of African-Caribbeans, at around 30\% for both wards (with a generic ‘South Asian’ population of over 50\%). However, both our male and female Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewers reported that recruiting remained a difficult process.

In previous research, our female interviewer had already established a working relationship with a local community centre that housed several ‘Asian’ community interest groups, such
as Pakistani and/or generic ‘Asian’ women’s drop-in centres and mothers and toddlers groups. She began recruitment by approaching staff and attendees of such groups. From these initial contacts, further informants were reached through snowballing.

Our male Pakistani-Kashmiri researcher also approached a number of organisational sites, such as the local mosque and ‘Asian’ community centre. However, he found recruiting through organisations less helpful in eliciting potential volunteer responses, and relied more upon his extensive knowledge of the local Pakistani-Kashmiri community forged through over thirty years residence within it. As demonstrated in the sections below, although gender and age are formally included under one category, the axes of gender (and to some extent age) run through many of the following observations in relation to recruitment issues from the Pakistani-Kashmiri community.

(1) Informants’ organisational affiliation

The social construction of gender limited the participation of Pakistani-Kashmiri women in local community organisations. Cultural and religious norms around 'modesty' meant that the lives of many women were centred around their home and family, and that involvement in public meetings or groups was often not deemed appropriate for women. We found that opportunities for participation in public groups by Pakistani-Kashmiri women were mostly limited to gender-specific organisations. The mother and toddler groups and women’s drop-in centre provided useful points of contact with the relatively small proportion of Pakistani-Kashmiri women who did attend such groups.

Moreover, within such organisations, particular modes of approaching potential interviewees proved more successful than others. Personal introductions and personal contact were highly important here. Thus, our researcher found that an effective mode of recruitment was to first approach organisation staff, who would personally introduce the research to potential interviewees before introducing the researcher, as opposed to the researcher approaching people directly at meetings. Thus, mediation through a third, known person facilitated access to Pakistani-Kashmiri women. Thereafter, snowballing proved a useful way of contacting non-organisationally-affiliated women, facilitated by the very dense interpersonal kinship and friendship networks characterising the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. As well as
introduction by a common acquaintance, face-to-face meetings between interviewer and potential interviewees proved important to encourage their participation.

Personal contact also proved central to recruitment within the male Pakistani-Kashmiri group, despite the existence of organisations salient to Pakistani-Kashmiri men. The local ‘Asian’ community centre proved a useful way of contacting young Pakistani-Kashmiri males. However, the older age group making use of the centre was comprised mainly of people of Sikh-Indian origin. This is not to say that older Pakistani-Kashmiri men were actively excluded, but rather that, over time, attendance at the ‘Asian’ community centre had come to be defined as something more relevant to the Sikh-Indian community than to the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. This observation draws our attention to the importance of considering local definitions of assumed ‘ethnic’ locations.

Local dynamics also influenced our recruitment attempts at the local mosque, which produced few informants. The mosque was not attended by everyone in the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. Moreover, among those who did attend Friday prayer, there was a perception that the ‘members’ of the mosque were only those people residing on the committee structure of the mosque. This perception may have been structured by recent local disputes over which religious leaders (Imams) should control the mosques. Where recruitment did succeed at the mosque, our Pakistani-Kashmiri male researcher did not contact the leaders of the mosque committee, but rather spoke informally to individuals at the mosque in an unmediated fashion. Paralleling our experiences of recruiting Pakistani-Kashmiri women in this town, personal contact was crucial for successful recruitment.

(2) Honorarium

In contrast to the African-Caribbean interviewees (and as shall be seen, particularly the white English participants) money was not perceived to be a motivating factor for either men’s or women’s participation in the research. Indeed, our female Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewer outlined scenarios where people were surprised to be paid, or where payment was almost forgotten at the end of the interview.
Advertising in local community and student newspapers/newsletters did not emerge as an effective recruitment strategy amongst the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. For example, only one participant was recruited through an advert in the local daily newspaper. It may be that the newspapers available in which to place our advertisements did not reach a large proportion of the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. There was a lack of local Urdu newspapers or ethnic community newsletters that we could access in the area. Furthermore, several of our Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewees opted for non-English language interviews, suggesting that our adverts in local English-language newspapers may not have been accessible to some community members.

(3) Informants’ gender and age

The factors of age and gender played a central role in shaping recruitment of Pakistani-Kashmiri informants. Women were more difficult to recruit than men. More specifically, older women (55 years and above) were particularly difficult to recruit, with few organisations catering specifically to them.

Recruiting difficulties partly emanated from the ages of our Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewers. Each interviewer had difficulty recruiting outside his/her age group. While the male interviewer would have been afforded relatively high levels of respect in the Pakistani-Kashmiri community, as a long-time resident of the area in his fifties, the same was not true of our female researcher, in her mid-twenties and resident in the area for the last few years. ‘Respect for elders’ was identified by participants as an important value within the Pakistani-Kashmiri community. Recruitment and interviewing of older women by a younger person may not be appropriate in this context.

Conversely, our male Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewer experienced most difficulties in recruiting younger participants (15-18 years). He ultimately interviewed some of the volunteers reached through the research team leader’s recruitment within local schools. Here, the age and higher social status of our Pakistani-Kashmiri male interviewer appeared to act as a minor disincentive to the youngest group, who may have felt intimidated in giving personal details in such a context. So, for example, it was particularly important to these younger participants that the interviewer did not know their parents.
Reflecting again the theme of modesty, gendered power dynamics came particularly into play when recruiting Pakistani-Kashmiri women located in domestic, private settings. Due to their family responsibilities and to social restriction on Pakistani-Kashmiri female public conduct, the home was the centre of most of our female informants’ lives. To gain access to the home frequently required mediation through partners or male family members. This did not automatically operate in an exclusionary manner. For example, one participant was convinced by her husband to take part, due to his positive evaluation of the research, thus yielding access to somebody who otherwise may have been inaccessible to the research team. Mirroring our experience recruiting within organisations for Pakistani-Kashmiri women, interpersonal recommendations were essential to gaining access to potential interviewees.

(4) Institutional context of research

The LSE university context of the research project, coupled with local university backgrounds of all but one of the field researchers appeared to provide a context that participants could use to validate the research. Some volunteers perceived that the name of LSE itself was well respected and by implication that the research study was important.

(5) Impact of style of interviews

Time again emerged as a disincentive, particularly for Pakistani-Kashmiri women who very often had commitments in terms of childcare and/or family responsibilities. Consequently a few interviews had to be broken into two sessions to allow us to access certain individuals.

(6) Previous Research Experiences

Due to the high concentration of Pakistani-Kashmiri people in the two wards of interest, other ethnicity-focused research had previously been conducted in the area, or in the town as a whole. We felt that recruitment may have been aided by this to some extent. Firstly, the involvement of the interviewers in previous research allowed them to draw upon already
established contacts. In the light of our findings of the importance of interpersonal contacts to recruitment success in this community, these contacts were essential. Secondly, the leaders of health and community groups had gained an understanding of what it meant and entailed to carry out academic research. Thus, they were able to effectively articulate our needs to potential interviewees.

Relation of recruitment experiences to our substantive findings

Our interviews produced a picture of the Pakistani-Kashmiri community in our town of interest as strong, inward-looking and male-dominated in terms of community leaders and those who wield power. These themes are clearly reflected in our recruitment experience. We have already illustrated the gender dynamics that led to male family members mediating recruitment of female interviewees, and to women’s low participation in groups outside of the family home. These factors made our recruitment of women more difficult than that of men. The gendered norms around social contact may be seen to reflect an implicit ethnic identity at work, adherence to which is demonstrated in the enacting of community norms concerning appropriate public participation and routes to social introduction.

The importance of intra-community interpersonal networks, to this community, was evident in the finding that personal recommendations and introductions by a known and trusted community member was the most effective route to recruitment. Even where interviewees suggested an acquaintance as a potential respondent, it was useful for the existing interviewee to make contact with that person, to ‘warn’ that they would be contacted by an interviewer, rather than the researcher approaching the person directly. Despite men’s greater opportunities than those of women for participation in the public realm, personal contact was equally important to their recruitment. The Pakistani-Kashmiri group was the only one where money did not seem to be an important determinant of participation. It appeared that people were motivated by a sense of family and peer support for participation rather than by the likelihood of individual financial reward.

A concentration on fairly closed social networks in this community structured our recruitment experiences in a number of ways. Thus, our female researcher, who has lived for only a few years in the town, originating from a neighbouring conurbation, was often received as an
‘outsider’. Unlike our experience in the African-Caribbean community, where matching of ethnic background without matching of area of residence was sufficient, among the Pakistani-Kashmiri group, even a number of years’ residence in the area was insufficient to afford acceptance as an insider. Elder Pakistani-Kashmiri women were particularly difficult to recruit, due partly to their absence in public groupings. Members of this age group were more likely to have emigrated from their country of origin (rather than having been born in the UK), tended to have low levels of participation in the public sphere and tended to have less experience of inter-ethnic, inter-gender or institutional contact than their younger counterparts for instance. This meant that Pakistani-Kashmiri women of over 35 years were less confident in coming forward for interviews, that their social networks were more likely to be constituted by extended kin and family and that it was therefore more their family’s interest in the research that would foster their involvement. Our access to older women was further hindered by the relatively young age of our female Pakistani-Kashmiri interviewer.

In sum, personal contacts within appropriate socially prescribed boundaries were of key importance. We suggest here, that matching of interviewer and interviewee, not only upon gender and ethnicity, but also on age and area of residence would greatly facilitate access to communities characterised by a focus on closed intra-community networks. Personal acquaintance or introduction are vital in such a context.

White English

In the wards of interest white English people constituted around 40% of the population – less than that of ‘Asian’ people overall (around 50%) but more than that of Pakistani-Kashmiri people specifically (30%). Most of our white English participants considered themselves to be in a minority in comparison to a generic ‘Asian’ category.

The task of recruiting 'white English' informants was fundamentally different to that of recruiting from the African-Caribbean and Pakistani-Kashmiri informants for a number of reasons, each of these related to what has been referred to as the ‘invisibility’ of white English identity. Crucially, this invisibility operates so that white English people tend not
to recognise their own ethnicity as forming the basis of mutual and common identification amongst white English people themselves. Many of our white English informants had difficulty conceptualising what an ethnic identity would actually mean for them. The ‘invisibility’ of white English as an ethnic identity had three distinct consequences for our recruitment strategies which we discuss in turn.

Firstly, in our town of interest, no organisations exist for a specifically ‘white English’ ethnic group, in contrast to the many ethnically-specific groupings which facilitated our access to African-Caribbean and Pakistani-Kashmiri community members. As the mainstream or dominant ‘ethnic’ group, white English people were everywhere and nowhere – they were the majority in virtually all wards bar our two wards of interest, but to make contact with them was difficult. Consequently, our researchers approached groups and organisations that were not focused on ethnic identity, but on more general interest issues that applied to the whole (inter-ethnic) community.

Secondly, a research interest in ‘white English’ has racist undertones to many community members. While ethnicity is seen as a positive resource for ethnic minorities, thinking about the majority group in terms of ethnicity may be seen as racist. A particular incident encountered by our white English research team in their efforts to recruit through adverts in a local newsagents illustrates this problem. While our other researchers had put adverts in shop windows without remark, attempts by the interviewers to distinguish a 'white English' group for recruiting purposes was seen as exclusionary, racist and offensive by ethnic minority residents and the shopkeeper ultimately had to remove the advert.

Thirdly, defining who exactly would qualify as a 'white English' person proved difficult both for recruiters and for potential informants. In contrast, ‘African-Caribbean’ and ‘Pakistani-Kashmiri’ were categories which were generally easy to define and with which people self-identified fairly unambiguously. In planning the research, the research team had anticipated that people who identified with ‘white English’ would be those who were white, and who had been born in England, which would differentiate this group from other white residents, such as those from Ireland or Eastern Europe. However, a far wider range of people described themselves in this way. Thus, we identified, by telephone, one volunteer who described herself as white English, only to find, on meeting her, that she had a Bengali father and was dressed in traditional Bengali dress. Another young participant also described himself, quite
definitively, as white English, although he had an Italian father. Subsequently, his self-constructed ethnic and national identity appeared to shift throughout the narrative of his interview.

(1) Impact of organisational affiliation on participation

Organisational affiliation was not a very useful avenue for recruitment, mainly because white English identity was not perceived as a salient platform for mutual identification. Thus, no ethnically-specific groupings exist, and our researchers approached instead a range of inter-ethnic groupings such as mother and toddler groups, senior citizens’ organisations, Weight Watchers and so on. Most groups were happy for the researchers to go along and talk to interested attendees and leave adverts. Recruitment was not effected through local church organisations, which did not represent a platform for collective action to participants.

Returning again to the ‘invisibility’ of the dominant ethnic identity, whereas African-Caribbean people who were organisationally affiliated tended to welcome research focusing on the African-Caribbean community, no equivalent response existed among the white English community. Thus, for example, being a member of Weight Watchers did not have the positive impact on participation in the research that being a member of an African-Caribbean development forum had. Furthermore, we suggest that, since a ‘white English’ group was not perceived as an important political platform, white English informants were less motivated to refer recruiters on to their acquaintances, in comparison to our other two ethnic groups of interest. Thus, snowballing and personal referral were not very fruitful recruitment methods in this group. Instead, direct contact with people was necessary for successful recruitment. Snowballing was particularly ineffective with the younger group of white English males, who were recruited ultimately at local youth clubs and through the research team leader’s recruitment in schools.

(2) Honorarium

We found that the honorarium was a key incentive to participation by white English participants, with white English women in particular describing specific items on which they
intended to spend the money. Accordingly, advertisements placed in two local newspapers were the most fruitful recruitment strategy for white English informants. We suggest that the honorarium was of relatively greater importance to this ethnic group due, in part, to their lack of identification with ‘white English’ as a relevant or political identity. There appeared to be some agreement that ‘local community’ was a worthwhile focus of the study but less interest in research goals and outcomes.

(3) Impact of gender and age on participation

While age and gender played a decisive role in the recruiting of African-Caribbean and Pakistani-Kashmiri informants, they had little influence on the recruiting process in the white English community. The only notable gender difference mentioned by recruiters was that white women appeared to be more motivated by the £20 financial incentive than white men. This may relate to women’s generally being less well off than men. Thus, where a lack of political or personal interest in the research means that the financial incentive is the dominant motive for participation, we may expect that this recruitment method will be most effective among those most disadvantaged financially.

(4) Institutional context of research: impact on participation

The university context of the research seemed to have little effect on research participation by white English informants. However, links with the local borough council and local government, evident in the membership of the research steering committee described above, sometimes caused participants concern. Some participants needed reassurance that possible discussion of confidential financial issues would remain anonymous and confidential and not disseminated to local government or social services, for instance.

(5) Impact of the style of interview: time, open-ended questions
Once again, the length of interviews proved a disincentive, particularly when people had childcare commitments. This was most acutely experienced by lone parents, especially where alternative childcare facilities were not available to them during the potential interview time. In the case of some of the parents of very young children, interviews were conducted with the infants present. In addition, there were some instances where people were uncomfortable about having interviews conducted in their home.

(6) Previous Research Experiences

Few English participants mentioned having taken part in previous research projects or having any previous experience of research. The only context in which previous interview experience was mentioned was social security-type interviews, alluded to by a few informants. Such experience may have structured some participants’ expectation of a clear question-answer format as opposed to the open-ended nature of our interview schedule. This experience may also have been related to our researchers’ observations that, even after volunteering to participate, some informants expressed a reluctance to disclose information on personal matters, requiring extra persuasion to take part beyond their initial contact.

Relation of recruitment experiences to our substantive findings

The most notable finding relating to ‘white English’ ethnic identity is its inexplicit and unclear nature. While contemporary theories alert us to the fact that identity is a shifting, fragmentary and dynamic process, understandings of ethnic identity were relatively straightforward, stable and clear for our African-Caribbean and Pakistani-Kashmiri participants in a way that was not true for white English informants. Despite the absence of any positive sense of what might comprise a ‘white English’ identity, participants often reported feeling disempowered and ‘swamped’ in relation to other minority ethnic groups, suggesting that some notion of a white ethnicity was in operation, albeit an inexplicit one.

As the majority, dominant population, white English people may not have to reflect on the nature of their own ethnic identities in the way that minority ethnic groups do. This absence of white English ethnicity, as either an interpersonal resource or a political platform, reduced...
our recruiting options. We relied mainly on means in which people could respond as individuals rather than as members of an ethnic community. This meant that, in our study, the honorarium was of relatively greater importance to the white English group, since they did not have an ethnic identity that would give social or political value to the ethnic focus of the project. We suggest that ‘ethnicity’ in this UK setting is seen as a way of mobilising groups that are defined by their minority status, and that it therefore appears an inappropriate way of accessing majority ethnic people.

Our interview data suggests that the white English community is characterised by less dense interpersonal networks than our other two ethnic groups of interest. This may be the source of our difficulty recruiting through personal referrals in this group. It may also relate to the value placed on the honorarium by many participants. In the context of the low socio-economic status of residents of our wards of interest, those groups lacking strong social network support may suffer poverty most acutely. Although overall levels of relative deprivation are higher for minority ethnic communities such as Pakistani-Kashmiri and African-Caribbeans in our area of interest, what we are tentatively outlining is the possibility that the way in which the poverty is faced may differ across ethnic groups, according to the nature of the social support available. Such differences in social organisation may influence the operation of recruiting strategies involving financial incentives.

CONCLUSIONS

In this concluding section, we outline four contributions we hope we have made through this detailed study of recruitment, and particularly through the socio-cultural approach we have taken. We then finally propose six key points to consider at the recruitment stage of social research.

Firstly, we have demonstrated some of the potential complexities involved in research participation. In our review of the minority ethnic recruitment literature, we suggested that the treatment of informant recruitment has tended to neglect the constitutive importance of stratifications such as ethnicity in determining the outcome of recruitment efforts. We hope we have shown that, far from being a marginal issue for social research, recruitment is a complex social process that merits systematic and theoretical attention. By providing a
detailed case study, we have been able to draw attention to some of the complexities arising in the recruitment process that often remain hidden from the final presentation of research, considered part of the technical background to the project, and not of scientific interest. We have attempted to view participation through a socio-cultural lens, in order to conceptualise recruitment as a socio-culturally contextualised process that is received differently in differing ethnic communities.

The uniqueness and complexities of recruiting in each ethnic community suggests to us the need for a nuanced understanding of participation, one which allows for different responses to invitations to participate and different modes of participation and recruitment. For example, our access to Pakistani-Kashmiri women was mediated by that community’s norms concerning women’s appropriate participation in public groupings, and appropriate modes of social introduction. Thus, participation in research takes on different connotations in different socio-cultural communities. Local community dynamics impact not only on the absolute number of people willing to take part in research, but also on the way in which they do so. Thus, ethnic matching of interviewer and interviewee proved particularly important to our African-Caribbean informants, due in part to a heightened awareness on their part of potential mis-representation by outsiders. In this case, we felt that ethnic matching was a crucial factor leading to high quality data, and facilitating informants’ critical reflection on their own community. Such differentiations as we have identified must be incorporated into research planning, in order to best utilise local community dynamics and resources to gain good coverage of the target population.

Secondly, we propose that the concepts of ethnic identity and social networks provide a useful way of conceptualising community differences in responses to research recruitment. Both explicit and implicit ethnic identities can be seen to structure informants’ responses to invitations to participate in our research. Thus, the relatively politicised ethnic identity of African-Caribbean informants led to their appreciation of our sensitivity to ethnicity issues. Operating quite differently, the modes of social conduct appropriate to an implicit Pakistani-Kashmiri ethnic identity determined the nature of our introductions to potential informants. And the implicit character of white English ethnicity led to our white English informants being somewhat puzzled by our framing our research in terms of ethnicity.
Responses to requests for personal referral differed in each ethnic community according to the characteristics of that community’s interpersonal networks. Thus, personal contacts were highly important in the densely interlinked Pakistani-Kashmiri community. While less significant in the African-Caribbean community, interpersonal networks retained an importance through the value attached to African-Caribbean identity as an interpersonal resource. Personal referral was least effective in the white English community, where social networks were least dense.

Thirdly, we suggest that a socio-cultural approach to recruitment allows for differences in the ways different groups participate to serve as data on the very community processes of interest. A traditional conception of sampling might object to the recruiting of members of different ethnic groups in different ways, viewing the fact that each group is not subjected to exactly the same procedure as a ‘contamination’ of the data produced. However, we would argue that the different ways in which people respond to recruitment is not a contaminating factor to be screened out, but reflects the reality of those people’s social and community lives. Recruitment and interviewing are social engagements as much as the community processes that our research seeks to address. Rather than treat the differential responses to recruitment methods by members of different communities as confounding factors, we see these differences as data in themselves, as revelatory of the community dynamics and modes of interpersonal interaction at work in these communities. We do not take the position that such differences prevent our access to equivalent processes in each ethnic group. Rather, we contend that there are no such equivalent processes to be unearthed behind the complexities of recruitment. In contrast, we view each ethnic group as a socio-cultural entity, whose unique characteristics would not be revealed if a sole method of recruitment were imposed on a situation unsuited to that method. In subsequent articles, we will seek to incorporate these methodological reflections into our interpretation of our broader findings about the way in which ethnic identities are constructed and impact on community participation within each of our ethnic communities of interest.

Fourthly, in the context of the recruitment literature being dominated by USA experience, we have examined recruitment in a UK context and engaged with some of the differing ethnic groups appropriate to it. We have confirmed the importance of the ‘invisibility’ of white English identity that authors have suggested, finding that ethnicity for white English people is not a salient category for self-identification, and indeed that, a focus on white English as an
ethnic group may be perceived as racist or exclusionary. While our experience may shed some light on other UK situations, we wish to emphasise that our observations are not meant to be reified or stereotyped depictions of essentialised ethnic identities and community structures - but rather a very geographically and contextually specific account of the dynamics of one particular multi-ethnic community at one very specific point in space and time.

To sum up, we offer six key points for consideration in planning recruitment among minority (and majority) ethnic groups:

- The intersection of ethnic identities and interpersonal networks has a defining impact on responses to invitations to research participation. Conceptualisation of communities as socio-cultural entities facilitates an appreciation of the constitutive impact of such factors.

- Politicised ethnic identities may produce an interest in ethnically-focused research, and may stimulate enthusiasm to participate.

- In communities where interpersonal relationships and social status organise social relations, personal introductions and matching on key markers of social status - such as gender, age, familiarity in community - may be highly important.

- Where neither politicised ethnic identities nor interpersonal networks are salient, offering financial incentives through advertising gains importance as a recruitment strategy.

- A diverse range of recruitment sites and methods have to be engaged and one cannot assume that places of worship or even ethnically-specific institutional sites will necessarily identify appropriate recruits.

- In light of the above observations on the complexities, uniqueness and subtleties of community dynamics, it is difficult to overstate the length of time that is needed to
gain familiarity with a focus community and identify factors influencing recruitment such as those outlined above. This would be particularly important in cases where local, ethnically-matched interviewers were not available.

REFERENCES


